The Dawn of Acknowledged Professionalism and its Impact on Rochester Baseball (Baseball in the 19th Century Part Three)

by Priscilla Astifan
The Dawn of Acknowledged Professionalism and its Impact on Rochester Baseball

A new era for organized baseball dawned in 1869 as nearly 3,000 spectators gathered at Jones Square to watch the Alerts play their opening game on June 4. Their opponents, the Cincinnati Red Stockings, had become the nation’s first team of fully salaried, acknowledged professionals. And their “bronzed countenances” and “rugged...
stubborn look” reflected weeks of consistent daily practice and polished skills. Dressed in short pants (knickers), and long red hose, the Cincinnati Red Stockings also set a new trend in baseball uniforms that would soon be adopted in Rochester and throughout the nation.

The reorganized Rochester Alert club was fortified with the city’s best players. Yet, hardly anyone expected these local amateurs, who worked at other occupations for a living and played baseball in their spare time, to beat a team of skilled individuals employed to play the game exclusively. Therefore, the 18-9 loss was encouraging. It was better than the 42-6 defeat the Reds had dealt the Niagaras in Buffalo the day before. And members of the Cincinnati press who accompanied the team accurately praised the game as “the most closely contended match” yet on the Red’s eastern tour.

The Alerts lacked the advantage of cumulative and consistent practice. But they had an abundance of determination, enthusiasm and young talent. Although they had joined the State Association two weeks before as a senior club, at least four of their members were under 21. Five of their nine who played that day, John Glenn, Sam Jackson, Eugene Kimball, John M Kelvey, and Ezra Sutton, would soon play in the nation’s first major leagues.

On July 2, the Rochester Evening Express reported that the Reds had returned to Cincinnati after “the most remarkable staring tour ever made in this country.” They had beaten all their foes including the nation’s best teams in New York City and Philadelphia. A comparison of reported scores validates the conclusion of the Express that the Alerts had played “as good as many” and “far better than most” of their opponents. After twenty games the Reds actually played, only one other team, the Haymakers of Troy, had achieved a lower margin of loss (seven runs) than the Alerts and only the Athletics of Philadelphia, had tied their nine run loss margin. The Olympics of Washington had been the only team to allow the Reds to make fewer runs (16) than the Alerts (18).

Inspired by the Red Stockings, the Alerts continued to improve. In July and August they won all their games, both at home and away, against prominent teams in Oswego, Syracuse, Auburn, Utica, and Albany; and they became the champions of Western and Central New York. The Alerts also continued to dare to oppose the nation’s best clubs in spite of the threat of humiliating defeat, and to learn from them. On August 7, in Troy, they were badly beaten 53-15 by the formidable Haymakers, who tied the Cincinnati Reds that month to disrupt their otherwise perfect season. Although they suffered a 38-27 loss to the visiting Brooklyn Eckfords on Jones Square on August 11, the Express credited them with “a good up hill game.” According to the Union and Advertiser, the Eckfords praised the Alerts as the “best amateur club in the country.”

In early September, the Alerts made an exhaustive four day western tour by railroad that included a close succession of games in Buffalo, Cleveland, Cincinnati, and Detroit. As they lacked the comfort of hotel accommodations and had to make do with little more sleep than they man-
aged in their coach seats, it isn’t surprising they achieved only one victory, a 30-8 win with the Detroit Citys on September 3. But the skills of their individual players and their overall team performance won them noteworthy respect.

The Buffalo Express praised the Alerts as “healthy,” “muscular,” and “gentlemanly” baseball experts, and they hailed Ezra Sutton as the “acknowledged third baseman of the country.” The Cleveland Leader complimented the Alerts as “the last and the strongest of the splendid clubs of Central and Western New York” and claimed that the Forest Citys had earned many “plaudits” by defeating them in “perhaps the most notable victory” they ever won. On September 3, the Union and Advertiser received a telegraphed report from Cincinnati which described the Cincinnati/Alerts game as “red hot” and “the best of the season.” Only one other club, the visiting Haymakers, had achieved a better score (32-19) against the Reds, and the Alerts were only whitewashed in two innings as opposed to the Red Stockings’ three. An account from the Cincinnati Chronicle, reprinted in the Express on September 6, praised the work of left fielder Sam Jackson, and also catcher John McKelvey, “who made some catches that will cause him to be remembered by base ball men here for a long time.”

Baseball had begun to inspire poetry. The following verse, written by “a base ball enthusiast,” was printed as follows in the Rochester Evening Express on August 26, 1870. It also appears in a slightly different form but with identical wording, on the inside cover of Baseball for the Fun of It, co-written by Mark Alvarez, Mark Rucker and Tom Schreiber, published by the Society for American Baseball Research, 1997. It is thought to be written in the 1860s. The author is unknown.

How dear to my heart is the green-covered ball field.
Where good rival captains their men rightly place.
The pitcher, the catcher, the right field and left field.
The good men, the true men, who guard well each base.
The short stop so lively, the centre field handy.
The ball and the striker who aims to send high.
But dearer than all to the heart of good fielders
Is the leather-clad base ball we catch on the fly—
The Jolly old base ball, the well covered base ball.
The leather-clad base ball we catch on the fly.

In Rochester (and throughout the nation), baseball attracted “old fashioned crowds” that season. Game notices in the daily newspapers indicate that a number of less prominent clubs played regularly as well as many commercial, industrial, and civic employees who sometimes played games at sunrise before their work days began. Benefit games continued to be popular. On October 18, a team of city policemen beat the Birds and Worms, who were still a popular and comical recreational team, 38-36 at Jones Square when they played a game to raise funds for Mrs. Plass, a newly widowed policeman’s wife and her six children. Tournaments in several upstate communities were mentioned and on August 4, the Unexpected, an African American team captained by Frank Stewart, won a silver bat...
Baseball also continued to influence American culture away from the diamond. On August 7, 1869, a humorous editorial in the Union and Advertiser suggested that the recent trend for Americans on all social levels to include baseball phrases into their everyday conversation was adding to the confusion of newly arrived immigrants trying to learn English. But as the scientific game reached new heights, baseball's persistent problems worsened. The National Association had revised its regulations for calling balls and strikes in order to improve game efficiency again that spring, but few umpires bothered to learn or to enforce the new rules. “Errors of judgment we can overlook, but violations of the rules of the game, we cannot excuse,” the Express reported on August 10. The umpire who served at a Syracuse/Rochester home game the previous day had prolonged the game by ignoring ball after ball with no warning and no call until he provoked a spectator to read the related rule to him. “We advise those who accept the responsible position of umpire to read, at least once, the rules of the game,” the Express declared. The problem of inadequate financial compensation also became more acute as prominent teams like the Alerts absorbed heavy expenses while admission fees remained voluntary or difficult to enforce. “If a base ball game is worth seeing at all, it is worth paying for,” the Express declared on June 1, 1870. As admission fees, which ranged from 25 to 35 cents for significant matches became mandatory, tickets were sold in advance at various locations including jewelry stores, book shops, hotels, and pharmacies, as well as at the gate. But many fans continued to climb fences, or to find other means for a free view. The results were depleted club treasuries and fewer ball clubs. Baseball competition was restricted to established railroad and steamboat lines and dependent on their schedules. This often caused games to end early or to be postponed or cancelled. The lack of standardized time until 1883 also caused confusion. And without artificially illuminated stadiums, games were restricted to daylight hours, and long games might be interrupted by darkness. By 1870, more amateur players in smaller communities like Rochester were leaving to become professionals in

They also reminded clubs that qualified umpires could be obtained by sending a request in advance to baseball headquarters in New York City. Although many still wished to eliminate gambling and considered it “the curse of baseball,” wagering remained a major incentive to attend ball games. Local newspapers sometimes referred to the large numbers of “greenbacks” that were bet on significant national games or they quoted the odds at local contests. In Rochester, individual betting ranged from 25 cents to hundreds of dollars, and at the Alerts’ game at Buffalo on August 31, 1869, The Buffalo Express judged that “every one there had his little something staked on the result.” Although The Cleveland Leader had commended the Alerts for their gentlemanly conduct when they had appeared in their city, they criticized a group of “loafers” who had followed the team and disgraced the game by offering bets in the presence of ladies and otherwise had reduced baseball “to the level of a dog fight.”

The 1871 Washington Olympics of the National Association team, included two former Rochester players, Harry (Henry W.) Berthrong, now considered one of the finest all-around athletes of the post Civil-War era and John Glenn. Rochester Public Library
larger cities with teams that could compensate them through adequate and reliable gate receipts or regular salaries. Former Alerts Ezra Sutton and Eugene Kimball were now employed with the professional Forest Citys club in Cleveland, Ohio. P. Hoy, who gained national fame that season for his “swift and extremely puzzling” pitching, played in Washington, D.C. that year, first for the Nationals and later for the Olympics. However, in Rochester as well as in many other communities, there was still the belief that with sufficient discipline and practice, home grown amateurs could compete successfully with visiting professionals.

In 1870, the season opened again with the visiting Cincinnati Reds. But a newly prominent Rochester team opposed them. The Flower Citys, whose name reflected Rochester’s transition from a nationally renowned flour milling center to the nation’s leading supplier of nursery stock, were a merger of the remaining players from last year’s Alerts and their foremost local rivals, the Excelsiors. The Flower Citys lost heavily to the Reds. And on June 21 they suffered another disastrous defeat from the visiting Chicago White Stockings, a newly salaried team that had been organized almost exclusively to beat the Red Stockings. But losing to advantaged professionals was the least of the Flower Citys’ concerns. Petitioned by frustrated adjoining property owners, City Council was moving to eliminate most major matches and eventually all baseball and cricket at Jones Square and other urban parks and squares. The club’s immediate need was to find a suitable ground exclusively for baseball, where the game wouldn’t offend adjoining property owners and the field could be adequately prepared and secured to ensure admission fees. The financial factor was emphasized when the Flower Citys, who played a July 4 game in Cleveland with the Forest Citys, were amazed to find their customary share of the gate receipts four times greater than any they had collected from a Rochester game.

The search for a ball park was temporarily solved that month when A. G. Wheeler, president of the Flower Citys club, proposed to lease a field at the Fair Grounds in

In 1870, the Fair Grounds, which were located in Brighton, served as the city’s prominent ball park. The Flower Citys played their first game here when they opposed the visiting Forest Citys of Cleveland on August 12.
season included the Normals of Cortland, New York on August 17, the Olympics of Washington, D.C. (who were one of the strongest southern clubs) on September 6, the Maple Leafs of Guelph, Ontario, Canada on September 13, and the Pastimes of Baltimore, Maryland on September 20. The Maple Leafs game apparently featured the first reported international baseball contest held in Rochester since the Brooklyn Atlantics defeated the Young Canadians of Woodstock, Ontario at the Monroe County Agricultural Fair on September 22, 1864. Other city ball clubs, including the Rochesters and Ekfords, who were both prominent junior organizations, shared the Fair Grounds field for some of their games.

A vacant lot at the rear of City School No. 14, known as The Commons, also served as a ball field. On August 22, one of the most impressive games of the season took place here between a visiting Negro club from Washington, D.C. and a scrub team picked from the Flower Citys, the Rochesters, and other local clubs. Frank Stewart of the Unexpected, who played 2nd base, may have been the only African American player on the Rochester team.

Carriages filled with ladies both black and white almost blocked University Avenue,” the Express reported as it described the large gathering. The Rochester team lost the “close and exciting” match 23-19. But the green stockinged Mutuals, hailed as the Negro champions of the South, made a lasting impression with their admirable baseball skills and their “gentlemanly,” “quiet,” and “unassuming” behavior deemed “worthy of imitation of any club, white or colored.” The Mutuals’ roster of young District of Columbia professionals included former Rochester ball player, Charles Douglass. His father, Frederick, Rochester’s famed orator and activist and his mother, Anna Murray Douglass.

In 1870, Frederick and Anna Douglass hosted the visiting Washington, D.C. Mutuals, whose roster included their son, Charles, at their Mt. Hope Avenue residence.

Charles Douglass played on a Rochester team before he played for the Mutuals in Washington, D.C.
Rochester Baseball Fights for Survival as Amateurism Declines (1871-1874)

Rochester newspaper accounts of baseball games on all levels declined dramatically during the next four years as the entire nation struggled through a new phase of the game's development. When the National Association of Professional Base Ball Players was organized in the spring of 1871 with ten charter club members, it replaced the old National Association which had governed the game since it became nationally organized in 1858. Meanwhile, professionalism continued to become more common and to gain a greater influence on the game.
The Flower Citys, who had lost 2nd baseman, Sam Jackson to the Boston Red Stockings, a National Association club, failed to organize in the spring of 1871. The Rochesters, who became the Junior Champions of Central and Western New York after they won a delayed contest in Newark on July 13, became the prominent city team. But the Fair Grounds field was simply too inconvenient for significant matches in spite of special accommodations, and the lack of another suitable diamond in the city severely limited all practice as well as serious competition. An ideal location for a permanent ball park on Weld Street, between Scio and Union Streets, which was convenient to the street car line, was identified that summer. But plans to raise funds for a suitable diamond here which could be plowed, rolled, and adequately enclosed, didn't materialize. The vision persisted, but in reality, Rochester's first stadium at this site was six years away.

The small number of home games reported during the years from 1871 through 1874 were played on the grounds of the new facility of the House of Refuge, a boys' orphanage, reformatory and learning institution, the School No. 14 Commons (until it was enclosed in the summer of 1872), the Hunter Street Grounds, the grounds of the Mutuals at Genesee Street; and the University of Rochester grounds, where the college team occasionally opposed city or regional teams. Judge Addison Gardiner also hosted a number of games at his farm in Gates just beyond the city line. Teams that played there included industrial, commercial, and civic employees and the Birds and Worms, who competed to give the Rochesters a chance to practice or to raise funds for charitable causes.

Much like the professionals, amateurs increasingly relied on gate fees to meet their expenses. And since there was no convenient and adequate field in the city to ensure them, prominent regional or national teams declined invitations to play in Rochester or cancelled previous arrangements. Only one significant contest with an outside team, a "long expected" and "oft postponed" game with the professional Cliftons of Iowa, took place on the House of Refuge grounds on August 21, 1871. (The Rochesters were defeated 23-15.)

"Our boys cannot get good grounds here so they have to adjourn to neighboring villages to play their games," the Express lamented on August 26, 1872. The small number of reported Rochesters games with outside communities during the 1871-1874 season were played in locations which included Bath, Utica, Spencerport, Fairport, Adams, Watertown, Brockport, Clifton Springs, Churchville, and Oneida. Gate fees were now routinely bargained for in advance of engagements, and they continued to put more pressure on teams to perform well. When the Rochesters agreed to play the Eagles, in Bath, on July 21, 1871, they were promised all the gate money if they won, but half if they lost.

The Rochesters won most of the single games they played during the 1871, 1873, and 1874 seasons, and they also performed well in regional tournaments. They were eliminated from a July, 1874 tournament at Watertown, after they lost their first game to the Chelseas of Brooklyn, 18-2. In August, however, they placed second in a tournament in Adams, New York after they defeated the Tormentors of Rodman 13-5 and the Ontarios of Sackets Harbor 34-5. According to the Democrat, a feature on the tournament in an Adams newspaper commended the Rochesters for their precision catching and throwing and their splendid uniforms. They also took second place in a tournament at Oneida that month after they defeated the Summits of Bouckville 40-2 and the Artics of Rome 45-18.

Toward the end of the 1874 season, an attempt to revive Rochester baseball was inspired by a growing nationwide disillusionment with professionalism. The development of professionalism had encouraged advanced playing skills at all levels and had enabled fans nationwide to follow the first major league pennant races. But it had also caused more aggressive and ruthless competition, less gentlemanly conduct and reduced team loyalty as players continued to move on to accept better offers. In late September, plans were made and meetings were held to plan for a new repre-
In the 1870s, the University of Rochester played practice matches with local organized teams, helping in the development of early baseball. The University colors were once blue and gray, but were changed to yellow by 1883. Perhaps the comparison to the Civil War uniform colors led to the change? The “Yellow Jacket” moniker followed in the 1920s. University of Rochester.

sentative first rate amateur club that would consolidate the city’s best players, old and new. Newer, younger players would join with the hope of being included in the new organization’s first and second nines, while veteran players were more likely to join to lend financial support and encouragement.

The Rochesters’ 1874 season ended in late October with a final series of games with the University of Rochester team and the bright hope that all who were interested in preserving the national game would help bring regional and national baseball competition back to Rochester the following spring.41
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In grateful memory of Dr. Robert Marcus, SUNY Brockport professor of American Studies, who directed an Independent Study project in 1997.

My ongoing thanks to:
• The City Historian for encouragement and guidance since I began this project as a research paper for SUNY Brockport in 1986.
• Scott Pitoniak for his reading and insights into my manuscript.
• Naomi Silver, Chair of Board and Chief Operating Manager of the Rochester Red Wings/Rochester Community Baseball.
• Gary Larder the organization’s current President.
• Joe Altobelli, former Red Wing and major league player and manager, currently the colorful co-announcer during home games.
• Richard Astifan research coach and publisher.
• Carol Fede for the preparation and oversight of the manuscript.
• Frederick Douglass IV for providing “Douglass and the Mutuals of Washington, D.C.”
• Cathy Ingram, curator at the Frederick Douglass National Historic Site in Washington, D.C. for the photograph of Charles Douglass, a Rochester player and son of Frederick Douglass.
• The staff of the National Baseball Library and the National Baseball Hall of Fame and Museum in Cooperstown.

Endnotes
1. Rochester Evening Express, June 5, 1869.
4. Rochester Evening Express, July 2, 1869.
5. Guschov, pp. 49-64.
7. Ibid., Aug. 12, 1869.
8. Rochester Union and Advertiser, Aug. 12, 1869.
9. Ibid., Sept. 1, 1869, reprinted from The Buffalo Express.
10. Rochester Evening Express, Sept. 2, 1869, reprinted from The Cleveland Leader.
12. Rochester Evening Express, Sept. 6, 1869, reprinted from The Cincinnati Chronicle.
15. Rochester Union and Advertiser, Aug. 7, 1869.
17. Ibid., Sept. 1, 1869, reprinted from The Buffalo Express.
18. Ibid., Sept. 3, 1869, reprinted from The Cleveland Leader.
19. Ibid., June 1, 1870.
20. Full names are rarely given in early newspaper accounts; only last names, and in some cases, first initials. At this time, Hoy’s full name is unknown. (Ibid. Aug. 11, 1870, reprinted from The Chicago Journal.
21. Rochester Union and Advertiser, July 5, 1870.
23. Ibid., July 23, 1870, reprinted from The Lockport Journal.
27. Ibid., Sept. 23, 1870.
33. Rochester Evening Express, June 21, 1871, July 11, 1871, and July 14, 1871.
34. Ibid., July 27, 1871.
35. The Rochesters were defeated 23-15. Ibid., Aug. 21, 1871.
36. Ibid., Aug. 26, 1872.
37. Ibid., July 20, 1871.
38. Rochester Democrat and Chronicle, July 6, 1874.
39. Ibid., Aug. 25, 1874.
40. Rochester Evening Express, Aug. 27, 1874.
41. Ibid., Oct. 29, 1874.

Congress Hall at the corner of Railroad Avenue and Mill Street was a popular hotel and dining room. Its location near the railroad station of Mill Street kept its rooms filled. The Cincinnati Red Stockings lodged here during their visit to Rochester in 1869. Rochester Public Library.

Back Cover:
When the Rochester Driving Park, a horse racing track, opened in 1874, prominent city ball clubs considered it might double as a ball park. The grassy field in the center of the track served as a baseball diamond in 1875 and 1876. Rochester Public Library.