

ROCHESTER HISTORY

Edited by Joseph W. Barnes, *City Historian*

Vol. XLII

October, 1980

No. 4

Charles Carroll of Belle Vue Co-founder of Rochester

By Robert F. McNamara

A good deal has been written about the founding of Rochester by Col. Nathaniel Rochester (1752-1831). There is practically nothing in print about his associates in that project: his two "most intimate friends" Col. William Fitzhugh (1761-1839) and Maj. Charles Carroll (1767-1823). Neither Fitzhugh nor Carroll settled in Rochesterville. But they were co-owners with him of the One Hundred Acre Tract; they designated him as their agent in its settlement; and they collaborated with him in all major phases of the undertaking. Both deserve the title "Co-founder of Rochester;" and for that reason both deserve to be better known.

William Fitzhugh's biography remains, for the present, unwritten. In this article I sketch the career of the man who signed himself "Charles Carroll of Belle Vue" (just so). He was the youngest of the Hagerstown trio but the first to die. Though hardly a great man, he moved along the margin of fame. An optimist and an idealist, he sought adventure and found tragedy.¹

ROCHESTER HISTORY, published quarterly by the Rochester Public Library, distributed free at the Library, by mail \$1.00 per year. Address correspondence to City Historian, Rochester Public Library, 115 South Ave., Rochester, N.Y. 14604.

© ROCHESTER PUBLIC LIBRARY 1981 US ISSN 0035-7413

To the Manner Born

Carroll was a prominent name in pre-Revolutionary Maryland. There were at least two Maryland branches of this armigerous Irish Catholic sept. The American pioneer of the better-known branch was Charles Carroll "the Settler" (1660-1720). He crossed the Atlantic in 1688 having been designated Attorney General of Maryland by its lord proprietor, Charles Calvert, third Lord Baltimore. The "Settler's" son, Charles Carroll of Annapolis (1702-1782) became a great land-holder. This Charles's son, Charles Carroll of Carrollton (1737-1832), is well known as a signer of the Declaration of Independence.

Now, the Signer had an uncle, Daniel, whose estate, "Duddington," became the southeast section of Washington, D.C. Daniel Carroll of Duddington I had a son who is referred to as Charles Carroll of Duddington II and Carrollsburg. This Charles-of-the-unwieldy-name married a Mary Hill. She bore him three sons, of whom two figure in our story. Daniel Carroll of Duddington II (1764-1849) owned much of the property on Capitol Hill and was a prominent Washingtonian. Charles Carroll, this Daniel's brother, was our Charley. He was born November 7, 1767 in his father's manor house at Carrollsburg, north of the Anacostia River. According to the Carroll genealogy lightly sketched above, the Signer was first cousin to our Charley's father, and therefore first cousin-once-removed to Charley himself.

The family tree of the other main branch of the American O'Carrolls is of interest to us in only two respects. Our Charley was a second cousin-once-removed of the Carroll who signed the Constitution, Daniel Carroll of Rock Creek (1730-1796). He was similarly related to this Daniel's Jesuit brother John Carroll (1735-1815). John became Bishop, then Archbishop of Baltimore, and the first Catholic bishop in the United States. Bishop Carroll maintained a continuing interest in our Charles and his family.²

In its early colonial history, Maryland had been free of the anti-Catholic penal laws that obtained in England, and had welcomed Catholic settlers. The Cromwellian Revolution despoised toleration however, and later, after the accession of William and Mary, a series of colonial laws were enacted that

disfranchised and generally hobbled Maryland Catholics. Since Catholic schools were forbidden both in Britain and Maryland, prosperous Catholic parents, at no small risk, sent their sons and daughters to preparatory and convent schools on the Continent. The chief school for boys was the “college” at St. Omers in northern France. English Jesuits founded it in 1593. The Jesuits moved school and scholars to Bruges in Belgium in 1762, when the French government confiscated their St. Omers property. Then in 1773, Pope Clement XIV suppressed the whole Jesuit Order. The ex-Jesuit faculty thereupon moved the school to Liège, Belgium, where it operated until 1794.³

Both of the Maryland Carroll clans sent teen-agers to this school in the days before the American Revolution. The outbreak of the Revolution prevented Daniel Carroll of Duddington from going to Liège. Charley was luckier. The college books record him as a boarding student from August 27, 1783 to September 10, 1785. In the fall of 1785, Daniel came over to visit his brother, bringing with him a new student — their cousin Charles Carroll [of Homewood], son of the Signer.⁴ Our Charley stayed on in Europe for two more years. He probably spent part of the time on the “grand tour” of Europe that was considered an essential part of a liberal education.

He almost didn’t make it home: his ship was wrecked off the Carolina coast. On March 13, 1787, the Signer wrote to Daniel of Duddington (who was still in Europe), “Your brother Charles is lately arrived; the ship he came passenger in was cast away off Cape Hatteras, no lives lost.”⁵ Charles of Carrollton could afford to speak so coolly, since his young cousin was by then safely home. But what an adventure Charley must have had!

The Signer, in the same letter, written from Annapolis, said, “Your brother, I believe, will study the law in this city.” It is plausible that Charley, not quite twenty, did engage in further studies of some sort. However, since he is never referred to later as a lawyer, it seems unlikely that he took any extensive legal training.

Not that young Charles had to worry about support. His father, who died in 1773, had left the three sons extensive properties. Charles’s three estates bore picturesque names typ-

ical of the Maryland manors: Girl's Portion; Clouin Course; Aix-la-Chapelle — all in Frederick County.⁶ He probably took over when he became of age on November 7, 1788.

The Young Squire of "Hager's-Town"

Charles did not settle in Frederick County but in the county next west, called Washington. Its seat, Hagerstown, had become a humming center of westward expansion. On May 16, 1789, he purchased the first segment of an estate of over 1,000 fertile acres on the outskirts of the village.⁷ Here he built a very large stone manor house that he named Belle Vue, seat of a baronial plantation. The inventory in the tax roll of 1803-1804 listed, with other items. 182 oz. of household plate, 28 slaves, 27 horses, and 100 head of cattle.⁸ After constructing his mansion, Charles signed himself "Charles Carroll of Belle Vue." Pretentious? Perhaps. But he was following an old family tradition, and the signature provided a clear legal identity in a state full of Charles Carrolls.

Hagerstonians respected Charles's wealth, and they also came to respect his ability. On May 2, 1802, he was named one of the county judges of elections.⁹ He was also elected a director of the new Hagerstown Bank in 1807. A fellow director was Col. William Fitzhugh, The president and founder of the bank was Col. Nathaniel Rochester.¹⁰ In 1808, Charles became a founder and the first treasurer of the Washington County Agricultural Society.¹¹ During this same period he began to be called "Major Charles Carroll." This would have been a rank in the militia, more likely an aide-de-camp title than a command title. His affiliation was apparently with the Washington County militia. In the national capital he was called simply "Mr. Carroll"; but Hagerstown people like Col. Rochester hailed him as "Major." Hence the Genesee Country remembers him as "Major Carroll."¹²

There were few Catholics around Hagerstown when Major Carroll arrived. When they purchased some church property in May 1794, he was listed in the deed as one of the trustees.¹³ He helped build a log church, and made every effort, including an appeal to Bishop John Carroll, to maintain a priest in residence. Unfortunately, the congregation was too small and too poor to follow through.¹⁴

Carroll lived at Hagerstown for only a couple of decades, but he left pleasant memories. In 1881 an aged Hagerstown man, William Miller, still retained a vivid image of the Major: he could "describe the latter...with as much precision as if it were but yesterday. His courtly manners and genial bearing made an impression upon the boy which survives in the octogenarian...."¹⁵ In Southern terms, Charles was "quality."

Belle Vue was not a bachelor hall. Charles married Ann Sprigg (1769?-1837), probably in 1791. Her father was Joseph Sprigg of Cedar Grove, Harper's Ferry. Joseph subsequently became a judge in Washington County. His half-brother Samuel Sprigg was governor of Maryland 1819-1821.¹⁶ Ann was of the same social class as her husband. By disposition, however, she was a mother and homemaker: uncomfortable in the bustle of a city, but a skilled and gracious chatelaine in any rural manor-house.

Ann bore Charles four boys and four girls. Henry (1792?) was the first, and the apple of his father's eye. Next came Charles Holker (1794-1865); Daniel Joseph (1801?-1860); and William Thomas (1802-1863). The girls were: Hannah Lee (1797?-1836); Ann Rebecca (Mrs. Hardage Lane); Jane-Maria (Mrs. Moses Tabbs); and Elizabeth Barbara (Mrs. Henry Fitzhugh) (1806-1866).

What sort of education he gave his daughters we cannot say. It was no longer necessary to send his sons abroad to school. In 1809 the Major enrolled Henry in the new seminary-college of Mount St. Mary's, at Emmitsburg, Maryland. Here young Carroll became acquainted with boys of a family lately arrived at Emmitsburg: that of the mother superior of the Sisters of Charity, Mrs. Elizabeth Bayley Seton, who would be canonized a saint in 1975. During the course of the year, Henry himself felt a strong desire to study for the Catholic priesthood. His father therefore took him out of school. He did so, as he wrote to Archbishop Carroll, not because he was opposed to Henry's becoming a priest, but because he thought the eighteen-year-old was still too inexperienced to undertake such a commitment.¹⁷ Henry did change his mind. He and his brother Charles Holker won the A.B. at St. Mary's College in Baltimore (founded 1805, closed 1852).¹⁸ It seems that William and Daniel attended the preparatory school at Mount St. Mary's.

By the time the older boys finished college, the Carroll family had a different post office: the District of Columbia.

The Day They Burned the White House

In addition to his Hagerstown holdings, the Major owned several thousand acres in and around Washington city.¹⁹ On June 5, 1811, he and his brother Daniel paid \$20,000 for the Patterson paper mill near Georgetown. Since it would take months to set the machinery in motion, Charles decided to move his family down to the District. Ann protested; but Charles, who always had a way with her, won out.²⁰ They must have lived in temporary quarters at first. Then, in 1813, he was able to buy a colonial house in Georgetown from Joseph Nourse, Register of the Treasury. It was a handsome Georgian structure with flanking one-story wings in the finest tradition of the Maryland plantation style. Today it is the headquarters of the National Society of the Colonial Dames of America (2715 "Q" Street, N.W.). They call it Dumbarton House. The Major named it "Belle Vue." Perhaps he thought this would make Ann feel more at home.²¹

Another indication of Charles's increasing identification with the capital was his election to the board of The Bank of Washington on January 4, 1813. His brother Daniel was president. The first bank established in the capital city, it still functions as The National Bank of Washington.²²

When the Carrolls moved into Belle Vue II, the War of 1812 was already in progress, and a few months later the capital would become a battleground. Patriotic Charles had no doubt which was the right side. The British, he wrote to Col. Rochester on July 5, 1812, were guilty of a "most unjust aggression." Americans "should never sheathe the sword until we drive them from North America." It is quite clear also that Carroll, though he held no official position, was a man of influence in wartime Washington. Col. Rochester asked him that same year to inquire how his son John Cornelius Rochester might obtain an army commission. Charles went at once to the Secretary of War Dr. William Eustis, and reported to Nathaniel the gist of his advice.²³

Major Carroll was also a fairly good friend of President

James Madison and his charming, canny, first lady, Dolley.²⁴ The invasion of Maryland was to bring them into still closer contact.

In August, 1814, British sailors and soldiers landed in Maryland. On August 22, Col. James Monroe sent back word to the capital that the invaders were moving towards Washington. Washingtonians began to flee the city in the greatest confusion. (Carroll had fortunately sent his own family off to Hagerstown in late July.)²⁵

On August 22, the President, ready to leave for the front, asked his wife to remain in the presidential mansion for a day or two more, and to pack the state papers for removal. Charles Carroll rode in the presidential party.²⁶ Early on the 24th, a skilled British force routed a much larger force of Americans at Bladensburg. Madison sent word to Dolley to leave at once, for the enemy was marching on Washington. Carroll was on hand to assist her. However, she refused to go without the life-sized portrait of George Washington: *he* must not fall into Britannic hands. Charles and others tried to take it down, but it was screwed to the wall. Now he became vexed at the perilous delay. The First Lady even noted this in a letter she was writing to her sister: "Our kind friend, Mr. Carroll, has come to hasten my departure, and is in a very bad humor because I insist on waiting until the large picture of General Washington is secured...." Charles now had to leave, for the President awaited him. Dolley finally had the frame chopped away, and having entrusted the concealment of the canvas to two New York gentlemen, Jacob Barker and Robert DePeyster, she hastened off in her carriage. The plan had been for her to meet her husband at Carroll's Georgetown home, but that plan proved inadvisable. Only on the following day did James finally overtake Dolley, across the Potomac at a Virginia hamlet called, ironically, Difficult Run.

Directly after the victory at Bladensburg, Major General Robert Ross led his British troops down to Washington. They spent the evening of the 24th systematically burning Capitol, Library of Congress, Treasury, President's House, and other major buildings. The reddened sky was visible from Baltimore, forty miles away. What must have been the chagrin of Carroll and other members of the presidential party as they reined in

their tired horses on Georgetown Heights and looked back at the humiliated capital of the Republic.²⁷ The invaders finished the task next day, and left Washington just twenty-four hours after they had arrived.

However shocked he was by the British reprisal, Major Carroll at least knew that his eldest son was helping to restore peace. For months, a British-American commission had been in Belgium trying to resolve the conflict. Henry Clay was sent to join the American commissioners in January 1814. He took with him as private secretary Henry Carroll. Henry quite likely owed his appointment in some measure to the prominence of his father. But Archbishop Carroll was also ready to call him “a youth of great promise.”²⁸

After much haggling, the joint commission finally signed a treaty of peace in the old Charterhouse of Ghent, on December 24, 1814. It contained a sticky proviso: hostilities would continue until the United States ratified the document without any alterations. So no time was to be lost.

Britain straightway sent to the States the sloop H.M.S. *Favourite*, carrying Anthony Baker, the British *chargé d'affaires*, who bore the Prince Regent's ratification, and Henry Carroll, who bore the President's copy. The *Favourite*, floating its flag of truce, docked at New York at 8:00 p.m. on February 1, 1815. Baker's entry was delayed by technicalities. Carroll jumped into a post-chaise bound for Washington. Before he left, however, he announced the news to Gotham. Within minutes the war-weary city started a public celebration.

Henry's coach reached the capital at 4:00 p.m. on February 14th. He went straight to the home of the Secretary of State, James Monroe. By the time the two emerged, a crowd had already gathered. The statesmen drove directly to Madison's temporary home, Octagon House, and delivered the document into his hands. After he and his cabinet had carefully studied the text, the President announced that it was satisfactory.

On February 17, the Senate voted unanimously to accept the Treaty of Ghent. Mr. Baker and the United States government exchanged ratifications at 11:00 that same evening. Next morning Madison formally proclaimed the cessation of what had been an embarrassing conflict. No Americans were happier at the outcome than the Carrolls of Belle Vue. Friends like

Nathaniel Rochester and William Fitzhugh must have shared their joy. A year before, when Henry Clay announced Henry Carroll as his aide, Fitzhugh had written to Nathaniel that the appointment of the young man was "highly gratifying to his father." He added, affectionately, "I sincerely pray for Henry Carroll...."²⁹

The Genesee Venture

From what has been said of Major Carroll thus far, the reader may have concluded that by 1815 this forty-eight-year-old squire had settled down comfortably. Nothing could be farther from the truth. In a restless age, he was notoriously restless. As early as the 1790s, for instance, he was looking into the investment possibilities of the Pittsburg area.³⁰ By the end of the century, however, he had become enthusiastic over the potentialities of New York State's "Genesee Country."

Systematic expansion into western New York began in 1788 when the New England speculators Oliver Phelps and Nathaniel Gorham purchased a vast tract between the Genesee Valley and Seneca Lake. By 1791 most of the Phelps and Gorham Tract had been acquired by a British partnership, the Pulteney Associates. The Pulteney people chose a Scot, Captain Charles Williamson, as their American promoter. It was a wise choice. Williamson loudly heralded his lands in the American press. In 1792, as a special bid for southern buyers, he hacked out a roadway to the Genesee River athwart the mountains and forests of north-central Pennsylvania, from the present site of Williamsport, Pennsylvania, through Painted Post, New York, the southeast gateway of the Genesee Country.

Williamson's trumpet was heard in Maryland, and Charles Carroll answered. In 1799 he and his brother Daniel rode north to verify the Captain's claims. They seem to have met Williamson personally, and to have toured the Pulteney Tract extensively. Major Carroll made no purchases, but he returned to Hagerstown thrilled by what he had observed.³¹

In September 1800, Carroll rode north again, with two friends in tow: Col. Nathaniel Rochester and Col. William Fitzhugh. The two would not have accepted Charles's invitation had they not relied on his expertise in real estate. What

they saw on arrival confirmed that confidence. Nathaniel at once concluded that New York offered greater promise than Kentucky and Tennessee, in which he had recently conceived an interest. Halting at Dansville, he purchased 120 acres along Canaseraga Creek, ideal as a mill-site. His two companions held off until they reached the confluence of Canaseraga Creek and the Genesee River, a bit farther north. Here they combined to buy 12,000 acres in the townships of Groveland and Sparta. The acreage included the site of Williamsburg, a village set up by Capt. Williamson in 1792, but by now a virtual ghost town. To keep his companions company, Col. Rochester also bought a small farm of 400 acres in the vicinity of their 12,000.

Major Carroll and Col. Fitzhugh returned to western New York in the autumn of 1801 and made additional purchases. Nathaniel begged off because of illness. In the autumn of 1802, it was the Major who was ill, and the two Colonels made the trip.

All three set out in October 1803 on the journey that became part of Rochester city history. At Geneva they made payments to Mr. John Johnston, the Pulteney representative. During their conversation with him the Marylanders brought up the question of mill sites. Johnston suggested that they would be interested in an available location beside the Genesee falls. There Phelps and Gorham had consigned a "mill lot" to Ebenezer Allan in 1789, but Allan had soon abandoned his sawmill and gristmill at the small Upper Falls. The detour sounded worthwhile, so the trio came over to the Falls and inspected the area carefully from the present Broad Street north to King's (Hanford's) Landing at the Lower Falls. The locale was very primitive, but offered rich promise. Therefore, on the way back to Hagerstown they signed with Johnston a contract of purchase for the "the Genesee falls mill lot...containing one hundred acres." The price was \$17.50 per acre. When they made the final payment on June 22, 1808, the Hagerstown partners became full-fledged owners of the plot that is now the hub of the City of Rochester.

All three co-owners returned home fully intending to move to New York State as soon as possible. Sophia Rochester was willing; however, neither Ann Carroll nor Ann Fitzhugh would go along with their husbands' plans. So Col. Rochester

and family went north in 1810 without the Carrolls or Fitzhughs. The Rochesters initially settled in Dansville, New York.

In 1810 the Major put up his Hagerstown estate for rent, to be available in April 1811.³² But this probably tied in with his removal to Washington. Indeed, the whole milling project on Rock Creek may have been undertaken to fill in the time until he could move north. The War of 1812 also forced many Americans to adjust their business schedules.

Major Carroll complained to Col. Rochester about the hard work necessary to get his millwheels in operation.³³ Nathaniel could understand. His own new sawmill, gristmill, and papermill at Dansville made extravagant demands on his time. At one point he despaired of ever doing anything about the property at the Genesee Falls. In fact, he wrote to Charles offering to sell him his third interest in the One Hundred Acre Tract.

Carroll replied abruptly and firmly. The Colonel was most generous, he granted, but he should not dream of parting with his portion of the tract: "Hold on, and it's an estate for any man." Nathaniel responded appreciatively on January 13, 1811. The value of the mill lot would increase, he now believed. Perhaps not so magnificently as the Major dreamed; but it would increase.

Still deterred from moving by his own problems, Fitzhugh agreed with Carroll that the task of establishing "Falls Town" should be delegated completely to Col. Rochester. He was the senior partner. He knew the art of surveying. He was steady, experienced, and completely reliable. (Carroll in particular revered Nathaniel. "You have ever been my mentor," he once told the Colonel.)³⁴ Most important of all, Nathaniel was actually *in* New York State. Pleased by the confidence his two partners reposed in him, Col. Rochester never betrayed it.

In June 1811, Rochester began to make regular trips from Dansville to survey the One Hundred Acre Tract and map its streets and lots. Thus far the spot was simply called "The Falls." Now a more formal title was in order. Fitzhugh and Carroll graciously recommended that he name the emerging village after himself. Very well, said he. "Rochesterville" it became; and, after 1822, just "Rochester." The Colonel had a witty defense against wags who accused him of vanity. "Should I call it [the town] Fitzhugh or Carroll, the slighted gentleman

would certainly feel offended with the other; but if I called it by my own name, they would most likely be angry with me; so it is best to call it Rochester and serve both alike.”³⁵

If his partners had been gracious to him, Nathaniel would not fail to reciprocate. They had fixed his name on the town; he fixed theirs on two of the original streets: Fitzhugh Street and Carroll Street (now lower State Street). Once the map was drawn, he began the sale of lots. He gave firstcomers reduced rates, but soon that proved unnecessary. The opening of a bridge on Main Street was very helpful, since it made the “Four Corners” more accessible. After the War of 1812 ended, there was so much business and building that it left the founder almost breathless.

Col. Rochester meanwhile kept in close contact with his partners, and they with him. They found nothing to criticize about the Rochesterville operation. On February 16, 1812 the Major wrote to Nathaniel, “Col. Fitzhugh and myself are perfectly satisfied with what you have done at the Genesee Falls — your plans will certainly accelerate the growth of that place and make our joint Int[erest] in that property a very valuable one.”³⁶

Apparently neither of the co-founders was able to visit his Genesee domains for several years. Charles’s visit in 1814 was the terminus of a long springtime journey to study methods of milling and distilling along the East Coast. Swinging westward from Albany, he was amazed to see how many new communities had sprung up in the northern Genesee district since his last visit. He noted in his journal, “It promises to be the garden of the United States and is in fact so.” Now he could finally see with his own eyes what his senior partner had done at “Falls Town.” Rochesterville lived up to his expectations: in due time, he said, it will be “the great Depot for the produce of this wide extended country.”

Naturally, Major Carroll turned south to Groveland. He was impressed anew by the richness of the land he had bought. Within twenty years, he conjectured, this would become “a mine of wealth and amply sufficient for the establishment of a genteel family.” He hoped his posterity would appreciate this treasure. “I beg and pray my family not to part with a foot of these lands but hold on to them as the sheet anchor of plenty and abundance and wealth.”³⁷

Carroll of Belle Vue was sometimes taxed with over-enthusiasm. However, the praise he gave to his estate in the Valley was based on sober fact. Three decades later another knowledgeable Valley man assured historian Orsamus Turner that the Carroll-Fitzhugh terrain was as fertile on the slopes as it was in the river flats.³⁸

Northward the Co-Founders

By 1814, Carroll and Fitzhugh were preparing to move. Of course, they had to dispose of their southern property. In the spring of 1815 both put their slaves on the market. The Major advertised "about FORTY VALUABLE NEGROES, among whom are some excellent house servants, good wagoners, prime farm hands, & a good carpenter, suffice it to say there are few such Slaves at Market." Fitzhugh did not give the number of his "VALUABLE SLAVES," but explained the reason why he (like Carroll) was selling them: "He contemplates the removal of his family to the state of New York."³⁹ A New York Law passed in 1799 had provided for the gradual abolition of slavery throughout the State. Carroll also found a buyer for his Hagerstown Belle Vue, although the sale was signed and sealed only on June 14, 1817.⁴⁰

The exodus of the Carrolls took place in 1815, most likely in spring or summer. The party included the Major, his wife Ann (perhaps with her fingers crossed), his sons Charles Holker and Daniel Joseph, and his three unmarried daughters: Hannah Lee, Ann Rebecca, and Elizabeth Barbara. If Henry made the trip, it was not to stay. William Thomas was already committed to a law career in the South. (He eventually served for thirty-five years as clerk of the U.S. Supreme Court.) Jane Maria also remained, for she had married an attorney, Moses Tabbs. When the migrating Carrolls reached Groveland, Charles built a house within the boundaries of Williamsburg — or "Williamsburgh" as he always spelled it. Next year they had the pleasure of welcoming the migrating Fitzhughs. Col. Fitzhugh moved into a new residence called "Hampton." "Hampton," twice burned, no longer exists. The very site of the Major's home has been forgotten.⁴¹

Nathaniel Rochester had already sold his Dansville proper-

ties before his partners came to New York, and was farming in the town of Bloomfield. Only in 1818 did the founder of Rochester, now sixty-six, become a permanent resident of the village he had created. Some of the children of the co-founders also turned Rochesterian. Two of the Fitzhugh girls married men who lived here: Dr. Frederick F. Backus and Mr. John T. Talman. Carroll's bachelor son, Dr. Daniel, also resided in Rochester for a while before he went to New York City to practice medicine.⁴² But the co-founders themselves remained content with rural addresses; and we can guess why. Unlike the more mercantile and now more "Yankeefied" Nathaniel, Charles and William were at heart country squires in the Maryland tradition. For them, a vast rural estate was the proper setting for the "genteel family."

Major Carroll maintained close contact with Col. Rochester for the next couple of years, even though he was busy starting his farm and setting up his mills at Williamsburg.

In 1816 the three founders launched a campaign to establish a new county, to be sliced off from Ontario County. That year the trio, along with several other local petitioners, pledged \$500 apiece towards "a Court House & Gaol, near the Bridge at the Genesee Falls." The offer was generous, but it had a string attached; pledges would bind only if the new county were given Rochesterville as its county seat.⁴³ Col. Rochester carried the petition to the state legislature in 1817, but political and financial interests combined to reject it.

"Intrigue & land office hunting!" Charles exclaimed when he learned the news. It was typical, he confided to the Colonel, of these New York state legislators and their "Yankee" principles. Still, Nathaniel must not become discouraged. "...Rochester will progress. Nature has stamped its rapid growth in too strong colors to be arrested by the corruption or jealousy of its rivals...."⁴⁴ Charles Carroll was again to prove the prophet. On April 15, 1817, less than a month after Rochesterville received incorporation as a village, a state law authorized the construction of the Erie Canal. Col. Rochester had promoted that bill, too; and destiny marked the old Mill Lot as a natural canal port. So when Nathaniel backed the county division again in 1821, the effort was successful. The legislature created Monroe County and made Rochesterville its shire town. By and by it would become an important canalling center.

Another mutual concern of 1817 was the November flood. Raging waters turned the Groveland flats into a lake and rushed ominously north toward the mill town at The Falls. True, the upstream waters began to ebb on November 3, and Major Carroll found, to his relief, that his own sawmill had survived the deluge. Still fearing the fate of the Rochesterville mill establishments, he was debating whether to ride up and see what had happened. Just then he received a note from Nathaniel. There had been perilous moments, said the founder, but the high waters had caused less damage to the mill works than Rochesterians had expected.⁴⁵

Charles was as gracious a host at Williamsburg as he had been at Hagerstown and Georgetown. He and Ann often entertained house guests, particularly kinsfolk and close friends. In July 1817, for instance, his visitors were "Judge Sprigg" of Maryland and Sophia, Col. Rochester's daughter. The Judge was quite likely Ann Carroll's half-uncle, Samuel. Nathaniel had written to "Miss Sophia" to come home. Carroll replied that she would obey the summons, although his family would miss her company. But he made one last request: "Will you let her go to the Sulphur Springs with Hannah [Lee] Carroll and Judge Sprigg who will be at your house on Wednesday or Saturday?"⁴⁶ (Ann Carroll put great stock in the curative powers of mineral waters. The "Sulphur Springs" were probably those at Avon, N.Y.)

According to a newspaper announcement, Charles apparently played host to a Catholic priest on July 5, 1818. If he had found relatively few Catholics at Hagerstown, he found next to none in his new homeland. The nearest Catholic church was St. Mary's, Albany, founded in 1798. In 1818, however, St. Mary's acquired a zealous young missionary pastor, Father Michael O'Gorman (1792-1824). Bishop John Connolly of New York instructed Father O'Gorman to tour western New York and establish a new parish there. Through the Ontario county newspapers, O'Gorman made it known that on June 30 he would preach in the courthouse at Canandaigua and on July 5 at Williamsburg, "near Maj. Carroll's."⁴⁷ The upshot of his visit to the Genesee Country was the incorporation of St. John's Church, Utica, N.Y., on January 26, 1819. This first Catholic parish in "Western" New York was still far away from

the Genesee, but its trustees included “Charles Carroll of Genesee River” and John McGuire of Rochester (Greece).⁴⁸ A “Third Roman Catholic Church of the Western District” was organized in Rochester on July 12, 1820 — the congregation that in 1823 opened Rochester’s pioneer Catholic church, St. Patrick’s.⁴⁹ But Charles Carroll of Belle Vue played no part in the foundation of St. Patrick’s, and no active part even in the establishment of St. John’s, Utica. By late 1819, as we shall see, he was residing in the Missouri Territory — far, far to the west of even the “Western District.”

The Major did play a role, however, in the foundation of the Episcopal St. Luke’s Church, in Rochester. Nathaniel, William, and Charles had offered Lot No. 85 on Fitzhugh Street as a church lot — free to the first denomination that would claim it and build on it. The local Episcopalians hastened to qualify, and the co-founders — Major Carroll through his attorney Charles Holker Carroll — confirmed the gift. Thus Rochester’s first Episcopal congregation rightly honors a Catholic, Charles Carroll of Belle Vue, as one of its earliest benefactors.⁵⁰

One Frontier Too Far

In 1818 President James Monroe appointed his old friend Charles as “Register of Lands for the district of Howard County, Missouri Territory.” By the end of July, Carroll had accepted and posted his bond, and stood ready for final instructions.⁵¹

We may wonder what prompted this fifty-one-year-old gentleman farmer to break with his *métier* and his milieu. Was it his innate restlessness? This probably contributed, but does not explain all. Was the appointment, as has been suggested, a political plum awarded him for his backing of Monroe and the Democrat-Republicans? Perhaps; but the plum was surely not that juicy, and he had no need of the salary.⁵²

Within a few months, an anti-Carroll party in Missouri would intimate that the Major had accepted the office only that he might pass it on to his son Henry. Now, there may have been some reality behind this suspicion. Since the day of glory when he “brought the good news from Ghent,” Henry Carroll had failed to establish himself. Charles may have concluded

that his first born would be wise to go west and start all over again. If the Major went with him, he could coach him in the art of land speculation. That he accepted the post of Register intending to hold it only long enough to secure it for Henry does not seem plausible. In the fall of 1819 he was advertising the sale of the major portion of his lands in New York State, Maryland, and the District of Columbia.⁵³ That sounds pretty final.

The new office to which Charles was assigned was located at Franklin. Franklin itself, situated on the Missouri River at almost the dead center of the present state of Missouri, was only two years old. The town was to suffer a permanent setback in 1828, when most of its inhabitants moved away because of constant flooding. When Carroll first arrived, however, it seemed to hold great promise. Positioned at the then gateway to the West, it daily welcomed hordes of settlers and westbound transients, particularly from the slave states. Social life in Franklin was so much in flux that no religious denomination had yet built a house of worship.⁵⁴

The Major seems to have gone out to Howard County in the summer of 1818, long enough to open the Register's office. By September 7 he had already returned to the East, leaving Henry (who had either traveled to Franklin with his father or met him there) as "Acting Register."⁵⁵

Charles had many good reasons for this return trip, long though it lasted. He had to straighten out his business affairs in the East, and to prepare his family and household goods for their second and longer safari. On October 18, 1819, he signed a certificate designating his son Charles Holker Carroll as his attorney in matters concerning the eastern properties.⁵⁶ (Charles, Jr., just twenty-one, was at first nonplussed by such a heavy responsibility. But he more than measured up to it, developed into a good businessman, was admitted to the bar, and became a respected judge, state senator, and congressman.)⁵⁷

The appointment of an attorney may have been Charles's last act as a departing citizen of New York State. He had paid a visit to Nathaniel Rochester on October 2, 1819, and quite likely said goodbye then to the Colonel and his family.⁵⁸ The migrating Carrolls probably climbed into their wagons before

the end of the month. Those who made the trip were Charles, Ann, and their three unmarried daughters, Hannah Lee, Ann Rebecca, and Elizabeth Barbara. With what cheer Ann set out the records do not say.

In the absence of his father, Henry Carroll, dashing and selfpossessed, had become a popular figure in busy little Franklin. When the town observed Independence Day in 1819, he spoke publicly in favor of the admission of Missouri to the Union as a slave-state: a sentiment shared by the majority of his listeners.⁵⁹ He also praised the current "Yellowstone Policy" of Secretary of State John C. Calhoun. The Secretary had decided to impress British fur traders and hostile Indians on the upper Missouri and Yellowstone rivers by sending up a small army in steamboats. Calhoun's Yellowstone army, headed by Col. Henry Atkinson, docked at the Franklin wharf in late July, and on July 23, the Franklinites honored its officers with a special dinner. At the dinner Henry proposed a volunteer toast that would have delighted his ardently patriotic father: "The character of American Citizen — beyond praise."⁶⁰ The expedition eventually fizzled; but no matter.

While he was serving as a stand-in for Charles of Belle Vue, Henry Carroll was also engaged with a business partner named Robert Wallace in laying out a new village to be called "Missouriton."⁶¹

If the Major's first-born had a gift for making friends in Howard County, he also had a flair for making enemies. As early as September 14, 1819, 320 local citizens sent a petition to President Monroe protesting against both himself and his father. They were angry with Charles because his "improper and untimely absence" prevented the land office from functioning efficiently. They were also beginning to fear that "it is not the intention of the Register ever to return; and that he intends resigning his office in favour of his son, Henry Carroll." This course, they said, would be disastrous. Henry had already shown himself "totally incompetent" in the Register's office. "He has not mind sufficient to comprehend the ordinary details, much less direct them." They charged him with assigning the same plots to more than one bidder, and of using illegal methods to acquire lands for himself, including the tract at "Missouriton." Therefore they urgently petitioned the Presi-

dent either to order Major Carroll to return to his office, or to designate as his successor a person who had the proper qualifications.⁶²

Apart from its sneering allusions to "young Carroll," the petition seemed well documented and attested. However, there lay behind it the personal animus of Major Richard Gentry (1778?-1837), one of the signers. A land speculator who had recently come to Franklin, the Major was a professional soldier, and a good one, who would eventually die in action in the Seminole War. He, too, was respected by the Franklinites as a man of high soldierly honor. But he was apparently also a man of choler and impulse.⁶³ After the petition had been sent to President Monroe — and Gentry was certainly one of its composers — the feud between him and Henry developed into one of "great virulence and asperity." The reputations of two sensitive men were now at stake. A collision between them seemed inevitable.

On February 29, 1820, Richard Gentry shot and killed Henry Carroll. "Awful catastrophe!" cried the *Missouri Intelligencer*. "Mr. Carroll," it related, "intending to ride a few miles had just passed the limits of the town when he was overtaken by Maj. Gentry, who had proceeded for that purpose, and after a few words between them (they both having drawn their pistols) Maj. Gentry discharged the contents of his through the breast of Mr. Carroll who instantly expired."⁶⁴

There was a large turnout of local citizens for the burial on March 1. This testified, said the newspaper, "to the worth of the deceased, and the loss society has sustained." The March 18th *Intelligencer* carried a tender elegy, unsigned, on the "dear murdered youth" who in his life had sought "the ways of truth."

Charles was back in Franklin when it all happened. He and his family had arrived toward the end of 1819 — several weeks after the petition was sent to the President. Henry discussed the Gentry charges with his father, and the Major accepted his son's explanations. Was his acceptance prompted by full conviction, or by family honor, or by both?

The untimely and violent death of his first-born, at the age of twenty-eight, was a crushing blow to the senior Carroll. He disclosed his feelings in an official letter written on March 11,

1820 to Josiah Meigs, his Washington superior. "I have been truly unfortunate since my last communication," he said, "my son Henry in riding out on Tuesday, 29th feb: was deliberately shot on horseback & fell a corpse on the Ground, he had completely refuted the malicious charges brought against him & he was shot by a Major Richard Gentry who had given a Certif^e carrying on the face of it a malignant falsehood which was made apparent by the most respectable Depositions, & thus has fallen a young man of high honor & feeling to the Envy of a dastardly Assassin — I can say no more, my heart bleeds at the atrocious act."⁶⁵

Convinced as he was of Gentry's guilt, Charles engaged three of the best available lawyers to aid the prosecution. The case was difficult, however, since there had been no witnesses. Only on March 22, 1821, more than a year after Henry's death, did the grand jury, after rejecting two earlier bills of indictment, arraign Gentry for murder in the first degree. The accused had the good fortune to be defended by one of the ablest of Missouri lawyers, the future senator, Thomas Hart Benton. On March 30, 1821, the jury brought in a verdict of "not guilty." Friends of Henry Carroll continued to consider this a miscarriage of justice.⁶⁶ However, the election of Major Gentry to the state senate in 1826 indicated that the majority of his Missouri constituents thought the trial had been fair.

Charles himself never quite recovered from the shock of the tragedy. Through the summer of 1821 he continued his work as Register.⁶⁷ That fall, however, he submitted his resignation. President Monroe had named his successor by mid-December.⁶⁸ Whatever motivated Carroll to move west in the first place, Missouri had lost all its enchantment.

Back to the Valley

Good news! Charles Holker Carroll wrote to Nathaniel Rochester on February 18, 1822. The Carrolls were coming back to Groveland to stay. Young Charles added, "My father & family anticipate much pleasure in again settling in a Country where they occasionally may have an opportunity of seeing you & yours."⁶⁹

It would take a while to negotiate the return trip. As admin-

istrator of his dead son's small but complicated estate, the Major first had to attend to a number of financial and legal matters.⁷⁰ Eventually, he was able to turn over the remaining details to his Missouri son-in-law, Dr. Hardage Lane. Dr. Lane had married Ann Rebecca Carroll in Franklin the previous November.

Charles, Ann, Hannah Lee and Elizabeth Barbara Carroll finally reached Groveland around mid-December 1822. Welcoming them was Charles Junior's new wife, Alida, the daughter of Jeremiah Van Rensselaer. He had married her in Utica in May 1820.⁷²

Shortly after his arrival, the Major wrote a letter to Nathaniel Rochester. He sent along some endorsements the Colonel had requested. He also promised to collect documentation on the title to the Mill Lot. The heirs of Ebenezer Allan were contesting it, but Carroll did not think the Widow Allan had "a ghost of a claim."

"Should there be good sleighing," he continued genially, "I will come down for a day or two to pay my respects to you & your family. I want much to see you all, & to take my friend Thomas by the hand & his Bride. Mrs. Carroll says you & Mrs. Rochester must come up to see us as soon as the roads are in good condition for traveling.... I see by the Papers, that Clay & Adams are likely to have a News-Paper Discussion. Mr. Clay will find the Secretary too able for him with the Pen."⁷³

It was like old times again: Mill Lot business; family get-togethers; Jeffersonian politics.

Unfortunately, Charles's second sojourn in the Genesee Valley was brief. A "tedious illness" had fastened on him (perhaps even while he was in Missouri). He died on October 28, 1823, aged fifty-six.

Early on October 29, Charles Holker sent off a note by special courier to Col. Rochester. He announced the death of "my lamented father." Interment, he said, was scheduled for the following day. "I regret that the weather is so unfavorable, but we shall be very happy to see yourself or any of your family & friends who can come up." In a postscript, Charles added: "I will thank you particularly to mention it to your son Thomas for whom my father had the warmest attachment. I will thank you to have purchased 1/2 dozen pairs of *mourning* gloves for

gentlemen and 1/2 dozen for Ladies & send them by the bearer.”⁷⁴

Charles Carroll of Belle Vue was buried in the Williamsburg cemetery.⁷⁵ Were the Rochesters and the Fitzhughs at graveside? Surely Nathaniel would have made every effort to say farewell to his “most intimate friend.” And young Thomas, too, for whom Charles had high hopes, would have been there if possible.

Although not so famous as to merit wide press coverage, Carroll was eulogized in the *National Intelligencer* of Washington. The obituary was short on facts and long in praise; but its praise was discerning. “Ardent in his feelings and generous and affectionate in his more intimate relations, his life was of inestimable value to every one within the circle of his intercourse.... Mr. Carroll was long a resident of the District of Columbia where he was universally esteemed and respected.”⁷⁶ Positive testimonials also came from Hagerstown, the Genesee Country, and even Franklin, Missouri. He died what he was born to be and strove to be: a gentleman, a patriot, and a man of honor, in an age when gentility, patriotism, and good name were rated high. Psychologists might read some ambivalence in his “migratory nature.”⁷⁷ But to be restless is to be human.

On September 13, 1831, the village trustees of Rochester passed the following motion: “Resolved, that the name of Carroll Street be changed to State Street.” The village had just lost a property lawsuit to Major Carroll’s son and heir, Charles Holker Carroll.⁷⁸ Rochester historians have called the erasing of Carroll Street “an act of petty revenge.” “Good law but execrable taste,” exclaimed Charles Elliott Fitch, editor of the *Democrat and Chronicle*.⁷⁹ Indeed it was inept. Nathaniel had intended to honor the Major, not his son. Nor could he protest the change. The founder had breathed his last on May 17, 1831.

Fortunately, the Rochester City Council eventually made an *amende honorable*. On July 10, 1973, they considered and approved another resolution presented by the then Mayor, Councilman Stephen May. It ruled: “that the park facility known as Genesee Crossroads Park West be renamed ‘Charles Carroll Park’ in honor of Major Charles Carroll, one of the co-founders of the City of Rochester.”⁸⁰

It is good to know that once again the names of both co-founders are attached to sites within the old Mill Lot that came to be Rochester.



Charles Carroll of Belle Vue

Notes

1. This article owes much to the 1894 lecture, "Rochester, Its Founders and Its Founding," by Howard L. Osgood, reprinted in Rochester **Historical Society Publication Fund Series** [hereafter **RHSPFS**], I (1922), 53-70. Although he attached no notes, his collection of Nathaniel Rochester papers [hereafter "NRP"], arranged in "groups" (Roman numerals) is in the Rochester Public Library. I have not examined the Charles Carroll items in the papers of Daniel Carroll of Duddington, and of James and Dolley Madison (all in the Library of Congress); or in the Thomas A. Simms Collection (New York Public Library). I thank all archival officials who have helped me; and particularly: Rev. John J. Tierney, Baltimore; Conover Hunt-Jones, Dallas, Texas; Alma Vaughan and Dr. John Crighton, Columbia, Missouri; M. Patricia Schaap, Geneseo; Mrs. Jessie Terwiliger, Canandaigua; Msgr. Hugh J. Phillips, Emmitsburg, Maryland; Howard L. Spessard and J. Chris Ramsey, Hagerstown; Rev. Robert McMain, and George Kackley, Washington; and, for various services, the Frick Art Reference Library, New York.
2. For the basic Carroll genealogy, see: Ann C. VanDevanter, ed., "**Anywhere So Long as There Be Freedom...**" (Baltimore, 1975); and Kate M. Rowland, **The Life and Correspondence of Charles Carroll of Carrollton** (New York, 1898).
3. Hubert Chadwick, **St. Omers to Stonyhurst...** (London, 1962), *passim*.
4. Registers of Liège academy, kindness of F. J. Turner, S.J., Stonyhurst College, England; Rowland, **Carroll of Carrollton**, II, 101. (Charles's *alma mater* has functioned at Stonyhurst since 1794.)
5. Rowland, **Carroll of Carrollton**, II, 104-05.
6. Allen C. Clark, "Daniel Carroll of Duddington," **Records of the Columbia Historical Society** (Washington, D.C.), XXXIX (1938), 45. (**RCHS**).
7. Deed of property, Charles Carroll of Belle Vue to Matthias Schaffner June 14, 1817, Washington Co. Land Record, Vol. CC, 23, pp. 184-185. J. Thomas Scharf, **History of Western Maryland** (Baltimore, 1968), II, 1018-19.
8. Property Tax Roll, Elizabeth Hundred, 1803/1804, kindness of J. Chris Ramsey, Hagerstown.
9. **Maryland Herald and Elizabeth-Town Weekly Advertiser** (Hagerstown), May 12, 1802.
10. Thomas J. C. Williams, **A History of Washington County, Maryland** (Baltimore, 1968), I, 135.
11. Anon., **The Hagerstown Bank...** (n.p., 1910), p. 154.
12. New York state obituaries call him "Major": Canandaigua (**Ontario Repository**, November 4, 1823); and Rochester (**Rochester Telegraph**, November 11, 1823). So does his tombstone.
13. **Records**, Washington County Courthouse., Liber H. Folio 847, Lot 204, cited by Rita C. Hultzell, **Mother of Churches...St. Mary, Hagerstown** (1976).
14. Archives of the Archdiocese of Baltimore (AAB), C.C.BV. to John Carroll, Hagerstown, May 26, 1807 (11-T-9); same to same, Hagerstown, May 5, 1810 (11-T-10); Rev. Charles Duhamel, pastor, to John Carroll, Hagerstown, February 16, 1807 (3-F-4); January 26, 1810 (3-F-5); February 24, 1810 (3-F-6); April 10, 1810 (3-F-7).
15. Scharf, **Western Maryland**, II, 1017-28.
16. Christopher Johnston, "The Sprigg Family," **Maryland Historical Magazine**, XVIII (1913), 74-84.
17. For Henry's clerical leanings, see AAB, C.C.BV. to John Carroll, Hagerstown, May 5, 1810 (11-T-10). Ledger I, Archives of Mt. St. Mary's, lists Henry as a boarder December 10, 1809 to May 1, 1810. The William and Daniel Carroll named in the same ledger seem to be his brothers. For the Seton connection, see Joseph I. Dirvin, C.M., **Mrs. Seton** (New York, 1962, 1975), p. 347.
18. Appendix, "Students of St. Mary's College," in Anon., **Memorial Volume of the Centenary of St. Mary's Seminary of St. Sulpice** (Baltimore, 1891).

19. In 1819 he offered for public sale 3000 acres in the vicinity of the capital and a gristmill and distillery in Prince George Co. **Ontario Messenger**, November 1819, cited by F. J. Zwierlein, **Life and Letters of Bishop McQuaid** (Rochester, 1925-1927), I, 7.
20. Bessie Wilmartin Gahn, **Georgetown and Colonial Days** (Washington, 1940), pp. 58-60; Mathilde Williams, MS, "Willie Lincoln," Peabody Collection, Georgetown Branch, D.C. Public Library; NRP IV: No. 135, col. 3; C.C.BV. to N.R., Washington, February 12, 1812.
21. Deering Davis, Stephen P. Dorsey, Ralph Cole Hall, **Georgetown Houses of the Federal Period** (New York, 1944), pp. 1102-05; Harold Donaldson Eberlein and Cortlandt Van Dyke Hubbard, **Historic Houses of George-Town and Washington City** (Richmond, 1958), pp. 106-12.
22. John Joseph Walsh, "Early Banks in the District of Columbia," Ph.D. dissertation (Washington, 1940), pp. 96-120.
23. NRP, Microfilm #5: No. 136, Col. 3, C.C.BV. to N.R., Washington, July 25, 1812.
24. Conover Hunt-Jones, a specialist, states that there are several social notes from Carroll in the uncatalogued Dolley Madison Papers.
25. See Note 23.
26. This account of the wartime activities of both Charles and Henry Carroll are based on: Walter Lord's well documented **The Dawn's Early Light** (New York, 1972), *passim*; [Jacob Barker], **Incidents in the Life of Jacob Barker...from 1800 to 1855** (Washington, 1855), pp. 108-18.
27. Attorney General Richard Rush, in A. K. Hadel, "A Review of the Battle of Bladensburg," **Maryland Historical Magazine**, I (1906), 197-210. On Carroll's role, see also Dr. James Ewell's "Unwelcome Visitors to Early Washington," M. I. Weller, ed., in **RGHS**, I (1897), 27-28.
28. John Carroll to Thaddaeus Brzozowski, S.J. [n.p.], January 28, 1814, in Thomas O'B. Hanley, S.J., **The John Carroll Papers** (Notre Dame, 1976), III, 151-52. Orsamus Turner also mentions Henry's secretaryship in **History of the Pioneer Settlement of the Phelps and Gorham Purchase** (Rochester, 1851), p. 366.
29. NRP, Microfilm #5, No. 64, Col. 3. W. Fitzhugh to N.R., Washington, February 9, 1814.
30. Allen C. Clark, "Daniel Carroll of Duddington," p. 45. See Note 6.
31. This account of the purchases follows Osgood. Turner's **Phelps and Gorham Purchase** notes that Fitzhugh's brother Peregrine came up to live in Geneva in 1799 (pp. 364-66).
32. **Maryland Herald and Hagers-Town Weekly Advertiser**, December 1810.
33. See Note 23.
34. See Note 33.
35. NRP, III. Typescript of statement by N.R.
36. NRP, IV, No. 135. Col. 30, C.C.BV. to N.R., Washington, February 16, 1812.
37. NRP, V, No. 115, Col. 4, MS "Journal and Observations of Charles Carroll of B. Vue on a tour to examine the distilleries and paper mills of the Eastern States. April 1814."
38. Turner, **Phelps and Gorham**, p. 365n. There was also much good timber on the Groveland tract.
39. The ads appeared in several spring issues of the **Maryland Herald and Hagers-Town Weekly Advertiser**.
40. See Note 7.
41. C.C.BV.'s house is identified as one later occupied by D.H. Abell. Obituary, Charles H. Carroll, **Livingston Republican** (Geneseo), July 27, 1865; Lockwood R. Doty, **History of Livingston County** (Jackson, Mississippi, 1905), p. 946; **Union & Advertiser**, December 16, 1893 (Rochester).

42. The will of Daniel J. Carroll, signed January 25, 1830, states he is "of Rochester, Munro [sic] County." Surrogate's Court, County of New York, Liber 154, 284.
43. NRP, VI, No. 590. Printed subscription form, 26 MS signatures.
44. Howard L. Osgood, "The Struggle for Monroe County," **RHSPFS**, 3 (1924), 127-36. NRP, VII, No. 82, Col. 3, C.C.BV. to N.R., Williamsburg, March 30, 1817.
45. NRP, VIII, No. 82, Col. 3, C.C.BV. to N.R., Williamsburg, March 30, 1817.
46. NRP, VII, No. 100, Col. 3, same to same, Williamsburg, July 8, 1817.
47. **Ontario Messenger**, June 30, 1818; **Ontario Repository**, June 30, 1818.
48. Oneida County Courthouse, Utica. Religious Associations, p. 37, quoted in Zwierlein, **McQuaid**, I, 6-7.
49. Monroe County Clerk's Office. Miscellaneous Records, I, 13.
50. Charles H. Carroll to N.R., Williamsburg, July 14, 1820; N.R. to C.H.C., Rochester, July 17, 1820. Both letters were first published in the Rochester **Democrat & Chronicle**, April 7, 1929.
51. Edward Jones, Chief Clerk, Treasury Dept., to Josiah Meigs, Commissioner of the General Land Office, Treasury Department, Washington, D.C., July 29, 1818; in Clarence E. Carter, ed., **Territorial Papers of the United States**, XV (Govt. Printing Office, 1951), 421-22.
52. Mathilde Williams MS, "Willie Lincoln." See Note 20.
53. **Ontario Messenger**, November 1819, quoted in Zwierlein, **McQuaid**, I, 7-8.
54. Anon., **History of Howard and Cooper Counties, Missouri** (St. Louis, 1883), pp. 165-71; John C. Crighton, "Old Franklin: Frontier Capital," **Daily Tribune**, Columbia, Missouri, June 25, 1972.
55. Notice in the **Missouri Gazette** (St. Louis, Missouri Territory), October 2, 1818.
56. Monroe County Clerk's Office: Miscellaneous Records, I, 347-49.
57. C. H. Carroll obituary, **Livingston Republican**, July 27, 1865.
58. A letter of C.H.C. to N.R., October 2, 1819, is addressed to the Colonel "politeness of Ch. Carroll of B.V." (NRP, IX, No. 491).
59. **Missouri Intelligencer** (Franklin, Missouri Territory), July 9, 1819.
60. *Ibid.*, July 30, 1819.
61. *Ibid.*, August 20, 1819.
62. "Petition of the Inhabitants of Howard Land District," in Carter, ed., **Territorial Papers of the United States**, XV, 556-61.
63. Our view of Gentry is based on: William R. Gentry, "An Old Printing Press, an Old Flag, a Six-Year-Old Boy, and a Pioneer Soldier" (St. Louis, n.d.); John C. Crighton, **Anna Hawkins Gentry** [Mrs. Richard] **A Woman of Courage** (Columbia, Mo., 1977) (a booklet); John C. Crighton to the present writer, Columbia, Mo., January 23, 1978.
64. **Missouri Intelligencer**, March 4, 1820.
65. Carter, ed., **Territorial Papers**, XV, 594.
66. **Missouri Intelligencer**, July 17, 1824.
67. *Ibid.*, July 30, 1821, notice dated from Franklin.
68. *Ibid.*, December 18, 1821.
69. NRP, XI, No. 586.
70. **Missouri Intelligencer** carried notices on the Henry Carroll estate. May 27, 1820; October 9, 1821; January 7, 1823; February 28, 1828.

71. **Missouri Intelligencer**, January 13, 1821.
72. **Ontario Repository**, May 23, 1820.
73. NRP, XII, No. 72, Col. 3.
74. NRP, XIV, No. 485, C.H.C. to N.R., [Williamsburg], Wednesday morning [October 29, 1823].
75. Ann Carroll survived. The cemetery list of the Livingston County Historian gives the legend on her now vanished headstone: "Ann Carroll, Widow of Charles Carroll of Belle Vue. Died at the Hermitage April 7, 1837, AE 68." "The Hermitage" was her son's fine mansion, built 1826, long since razed.
76. This obituary was copied by the **Torch Light and Public Advertiser** (Hagerstown), November 18, 1823; and by the **Missouri Intelligencer**, January 6, 1824.
77. Allen C. Clark, "Daniel Carroll of Duddington," p. 45. See Note 6.
78. Henry E. Rochester, "Riparian Rights in the One-Hundred-Acre Tract," **RHSPFS**, III (1924), 199-202.
79. Address, in William M. Butler, Geo. S. Crittenden, eds., **The Semicentennial Souvenir and Chronological History of Rochester** (Rochester, 1884), p. 15.
80. Minutes of the Rochester City Council, Resolution 73-73.