

SB
Rochester Public Library
Central Library
Project, 1923

SCRAPBOOK ~~15~~ scrapbook
Section
Rochester Public Library
= (C) Central Library Project



SB
15

Rr
OVERSIZE
027.4747
C397c
v.1

2564
Central Library Project
SCRAP BOOK

furnished by

Rochester (N.Y.) Public Library

Filled by.....

Address.....

Completed.....

Central Library of Rochester and
Monroe County
Local History & Genealogy Division
115 South Avenue
Rochester, New York 14604

**Reference Book
Not for Circulation**

—SATURDAY, JAN. 6, 1923—

Future City Envisioned By Speakers At Meet Of Men's And Women's Clubs

Rabbi Wolf Says City Needs Non-Partisan Government—
C. H. Milam Makes Plea for Central Library—Edward
Hungerford Suggests Stone Bridge To Eliminate
East Avenue Grade Crossing.

Visions of a future Rochester more
tutiful, more cultured, and better
served by officials and citizens than
the city of today, were given by four
speakers at the joint meeting of the
Women's and Men's City Clubs at
Powers Hotel at noon, today. The
meeting was in charge of Mrs. Helen
Probst Abbott, president of the Women's
Club, and Professor Justin
Nickerson, president of the Men's Club,
and, despite the unfavorable weather
there was a large attendance of men
and women.

The four speakers were Carl H.
Milam of Chicago, secretary of the
American Library Association, who
discussed "A Central Library"; Mrs.
Helen B. Montgomery, who spoke on
"What Kind of Citizens?"; Rabbi
Horace J. Wolf who spoke on "What
Kind of City Government?"; and Ed-
ward J. Hungerford, director of pub-
lications at the University of Roches-
ter, who spoke on "Rochester Among
Cities."

Mr. Hungerford said that Rochester
seemed to him to combine many of
the best points of the cities of the
east and of the west and was, above
all, the "Friendly City." It is difficult
to predict what another 25 years will
bring to Rochester, Mr. Hungerford
said, but it is almost certain that the
half-million mark of population will
be reached in less than that time.
This means that there must be a larger
Rochester in the sense of the exten-
sion of boundaries and, judging
from the past, much of this extension
will be to the east, Mr. Hungerford
said.

To meet conditions arising from the
expansion of the city and the increase
in population, there must be careful
city planning, Mr. Hungerford said.
He spoke of the project of the new
subway and of the manner in which
it will serve the city and contribute
to public safety by removing the in-
terurban cars from the city.

The need for a parallel street to
Main street could best be met, Mr.
Hungerford believes, by the widening
of Court street and its extension
through East avenue to University
avenue with a park-circle at its junc-
tion with East avenue.

Another desirable movement spoken
of by Mr. Hungerford was the raising
of the lines of the Auburn branch of
the New York Central on a stone
bridge where they now cross East ave-
nue at grade just beyond Winton road,
and the provision of a subway for the
trolley cars of the Syracuse line under
East avenue at the same point in order
that the trolley line might be brought
into the canal subway. The present
plans call for a steel bridge to carry
the suburban line over East avenue
at this point, but Mr. Hungerford said
that such a structure would be a blot
on the landscape, while the stone
bridge might be so designed as to
appear as a gate at the eastern en-
trance to the city, such as are found
in Quebec and in some English cities.

Rabbi Horace J. Wolf, answering
the question of the kind of a city
government Rochester should have,
declared that it was the kind for which
many died when the Republic was
born. "Not autocracy and not bene-
volent feudalism and not boss rule,"
but self-government," said Rabbi
Wolf.

"It does not need a city manager
appointed by a party, who keeps one
eye on the success of the party," con-
tinued Rabbi Wolf, "but a city man-
ager appointed by the people who
keeps both eyes on the welfare of
the city. Rochester needs a city gov-
ernment, which is nonpartisan and
operates in the interest of all its in-
habitants, which does not distribute
city offices as political plums but ob-
tains the best men for the job, irre-
spective of politics. Such a govern-
ment will come to Rochester when it
follows the example of many other
progressive municipalities and adopts
the city manager plan. The city man-
ager plan will bring to Rochester
something it has never had before—
government of the people, by the peo-
ple and for the people. This will
mean the scrapping of party names
that are meaningless in local elec-
tions, the annihilation of machines
which are primarily interested in the
maintenance of party power and such
efficient management for the city as
obtains in the world of business; but
this hope of self-government will not
be realized," concluded Rabbi Wolf,
"until every citizen in Rochester takes
his civic obligations as serious as did
the old Athenians when they made
each citizen reaching his majority
take the following pledge: 'We will
fight for the ideal and sacred things
of the city both alone and with many.
We will strive unceasingly to quicken
the public sense of civic duty that we
may transmit this city greater and
more beautiful than it was transmit-
ted to us.'"

The kind of citizens that Rochester
must have to build the right kind of
a city was discussed by Mrs. Helen B.
Montgomery. "Five elements are
essential if we are to have a truly
great city," said Mrs. Montgomery,
and these are education, health, jus-
tice, obedience to law, and religion,
affecting the mind, the body, the
spirit, the will and the soul of the
citizen.

"The one supreme concern of the
city," continued Mrs. Montgomery,
"should be the education of its chil-
dren. If it costs too much to do it,
right, why should not the vast ma-
jority of citizens who can afford to
pay for the tuition of their children,
pay? Let us have it right, whatever
the cost, and then let's pay whatever
it costs."

"Health is the next essential, for it
is right food, right rest, and right play
which helps mightily to make right
thought and right living. Justice, too,
we must have—justice that is cheap
and pure—for it is the substructure
of the whole."

"Next, our future citizens must
obey the law. This is the traditional
spirit of America, and we must have
it in the future as we have had it in
the past, if this government is to en-
dure. The last essential," concluded
Mrs. Montgomery, "is reverence for
the laws of God as well as for the laws
of man. With citizens who do justly,
love mercy, and walk humbly with
their God, the city is safe."

Librarians throughout the country
are unable to understand why Roch-
ester, with its fine university, its
school of music, its wonderful parks
and beautiful art gallery, should still
be without a central public library.
Mr. Milam said in the course of his
address. The Rochester of the future,
he said, will no more think of getting
along without this essential feature
than it would think of getting along
without its high schools, paved streets
and a system of sanitation, he said.

Mr. Milam drew a picture of the
library of the future which, he said,
will not be a dimly lit haven of quiet
where children, women and old gen-
tlemen repair to spend moments in
which they have nothing better to do
but will be an educational factor
bringing to the boys and girls who
are forced to leave school before they
complete their studies a means of
fitting themselves for life; and, to
the older portion of the community,
opportunity for reading and study
along lines which will enable them to
become better and more intelligent
citizens.

A plea was made by Mr. Milam for
more extension work in the libraries
so that small stations may be taken
to every part of the city to boys and
girls whose opportunities are limited.
He also spoke of the need for an
educational director who could lead
the boys and girls in the selection
of their reading courses; and for
more publicity of the type used by
correspondence course concerns, ap-
pealing to the ambitions of the boys
and girls. The library should be, and
is, an educational force which touches
human life from infancy to old age,
Mr. Milam said, and for this reason
should be accorded the fullest
support.

LIBRARIES SHOW LARGE INCREASE IN BOOKS ISSUED

Million and a Half Volumes
Go Into Homes; Growth
of 12 Per Cent.

ASKS CENTRAL BUILDING
Amount of \$37,000 to Begin
Central Library Service
Urged in Budget.

Nearly a million and a half books
were issued for home use during the past
year by the Rochester Public Library,
according to the annual report of Wil-
liam F. Yust, librarian. The number is an
increase of 12 per cent. over last year,
caused in part by the opening of a new
branch and in part by the usual growth
in the numbers of readers. The books
were drawn from ten branches, twelve
sub-branches, seventy-five deposit sta-
tions, 619 grade libraries in schools and
eleven playgrounds. The record by
agencies follows:

Agencies	Circulation
Branches	1,067,088
Sub-branches and stations	180,493
Grade libraries	228,403
Playgrounds	16,965
	1,472,951

There are 171,018 volumes in the various
collections, indicating an average circula-
tion of eight times for each book in the
entire system.

With Rochester's population estimated
at 223,325, there has been an average issue
of 4.5 books per inhabitant. In a recent
tabulation made by the public library of
Washington, only eight cities had a high-
er per capita circulation than this last
year. The tabulation covered thirty-five
cities having a population of 200,000 or
more. The expenditure per volume cir-
culated here this year is 112 cents. This
is lower than any in the entire list of
thirty-five libraries compared in the Wash-
ington tabulation. The city appropriation
for library maintenance was \$161,258.94
or 49.6 cents per capita. Twenty-four of
the cities had a larger per capita expendi-
ture than Rochester.

Nearly Half for Children.

Of the total circulation, 623,780 volumes,
or 42 per cent. of the total, were books
for children. Each of the agencies issues
children's books, while those in the grade
libraries and the playgrounds are all
juvenile. All branches except the busi-
ness branches are open every day in the
year in the afternoon and evening. The
Sunday and holiday circulation for the
twelve months reached 100,487 volumes.
This use of the branches continues to
show a steady and larger growth than
that of week days.

"Progress has been made in the use of
existing agencies and the addition of new
ones," Mr. Yust's report states. "A new
branch opened on October 1st in Portland
avenue near Clifford street issued 15,261
volumes the first month, the largest first
month circulation on record."

"An excellent site has been purchased
for \$7,600 at Culver road and McKinley
street, where a branch building will be
erected. It is hoped, in the near future,
this will be the first building ever erected
by the city for library purposes."

"A building has been bought on the
southwest corner of Joseph and Clifford
avenues for \$33,500. This will be altered
and enlarged to become the permanent
quarters of the Lincoln branch now in
rented quarters at Joseph avenue and Sel-
finger street. The new location is a strate-
gic one and the property was obtained
at a price that is in keeping with the li-
brary's reputation for economical manage-
ment."

"Another evidence of progress is the ac-
tion by the Common Council reserving the
river site for a Central Library."

Brighton Library In Winton Road Opens Formally

Time 11 A.M. Jan. 6, 1923

The formal opening of the new
Brighton Branch Public Library in
Winton road was witnessed last night
by hundreds of book enthusiasts who
turned out for the event. Several
short talks on the value of a library
in a community were given. Among
the speakers were: Charles H. Willsie,
president of the Board of Trustees,
Rochester Public Library; Abram De
Potter, president of the Common
Council; John J. McInerney; Rev.
Frank M. Weston of Brighton Presby-
terian Church, and Herbert P. Lan-
dale, general secretary of the Young
Men's Christian Association.

Music was furnished by Dr. Harold
Bowman, violinist, accompanied on
the piano by Miss Marjorie Gordon.
Mrs. J. Frank Norris sang. After the
exercises, the library, which has been
transferred from an old school build-
ing, was inspected. The librarian in
charge is Miss Carolyn M. Castle. One
regular assistant, Mr. Otto Block, has
charge of the children's department.

Times-Herald March 14, 1923 Mayor And City Librarian Favor Spring Street Site For Central Library Building

Say Site Fronting on New Boulevard Would Be Ideal for Library and Art Gallery Building Which Would Be Combined Memorial to Reynolds Family and Morton W. Rundel—Convenient for Public.

The plot of ground between Spring street and the new boulevard which is being built over the bed of the Erie canal, now occupied by the Reynolds Library, would be an ideal site for the Rochester Central Library building if an agreement can be reached by the trustees of the Reynolds and City libraries and the city of Rochester, it was said, this morning by Mayor C. D. Van Zandt and by City Librarian William F. Yost.

"A Reynolds Memorial Library and a Rundel Memorial Art Gallery erected on this site with the combined funds of the Reynolds and Rundel memorials would be of sufficient size to serve the city for years to come and would be in an ideal position to serve the community," said Mayor Van Zandt, this morning. "I sincerely hope that the necessary steps for co-operation between the two boards can be taken."

In his message to the Common Council, last night, Mayor Van Zandt said that while the erection of a central library building could not be undertaken immediately owing to the city's finances, it was not too soon to begin to plan toward that end and that he would suggest that a site be looked for and that a definite proposal be made to the Reynolds Library to co-operate with the city in the establishment of a central library along lines such as have worked out satisfactorily in other cities.

The Rundel Memorial Fund now amounts to \$407,803 while the Reynolds property includes the site and buildings on Spring street and the valuable Reynolds Arcade property on Main street east. Certain restrictions exist upon the Reynolds Fund, but it is believed by those who favor co-operation in the administration of the

two funds that these could be overcome. Similar situations have existed with regard to separate memorial funds in New York and other cities and the problem has been worked out to the satisfaction of all concerned and to the great benefit of the public.

Librarian Yost said this morning that he believed the present Reynolds site in Spring street to be ideal for a central library building.

"I believe the opening of the new boulevard will shift the 'Four Corners' two blocks farther west so that the Reynolds site will be practically in the center of the city. It would be available to the public and yet would not be in a position to be annoyed by the din of surface cars. I wish that some plan for the combination of the Rundel and Reynolds funds could be worked out."

Dr. Max Landsberg, president of the Reynolds Library Board, and Dr. Charles A. Dewey, trustee and chairman of the Reynolds Library committee, said this morning that the proposal to combine the two funds and to place the central library building on the Spring street site had never been officially presented to the Reynolds trustees and therefore could not be discussed by them.

The board of trustees of Reynolds Library is composed of Dr. Max Landsberg, Julius M. Wile, Rufus A. Sibley, Dr. W. R. Taylor, Dr. Rush Rhees, Dr. C. A. Dewey, E. G. Miner, George A. Carnahan, Granger A. Hollister, John R. Slater, Edward Harris, C. Schuyler Davis and Mortimer R. Anstice.

Dr. Rush Rhees and Edward G. Miner are also trustees of the Rochester Public Library Board. Mayor Van Zandt is president of this board and the other members, besides Dr. Rhees and Mr. Miner are Charles H. Wiltse, Mrs. Constance Hickey, Dr. Clarence A. Barbour and Charles F. Wray.

Central Library Needed.

In his annual message to the Common Council Mayor Van Zandt calls attention to the need of a Central Library. While stating that the city lacks the funds to proceed at once toward building and equipping such a library he makes the following concrete suggestions: *Times-Herald March 14, 1923*

That the city provide a site for a central library.

That a building fund be provided by combining the Rundel fund and the Reynolds library fund, if such a plan be feasible.

That a definite proposal be made to the Reynolds Library to co-operate with the city in the establishment and maintenance of a central library, co-operation along similar lines having worked out satisfactorily in other cities.

In making these suggestions Mayor Van Zandt gives official recognition to one of the city's great needs. A central library is the crown and capstone of a city's educational system.

Branch libraries are useful, convenient and have been well patronized. They cannot, however, furnish the books and trained staff to serve the needs of the student or reader who wishes to get to the bottom of a given subject or range widely over the field of literature.

Yet it is just this intensive study or wide culture that it is most to the interest of the city to make available to its residents.

That the co-operation of existing foundations should be sought is plain common sense. In New York the Astor and Lenox libraries added their collections and resources to the creation of the great central public library. The same plan has been worked out in other cities.

Education does not end with formal schooling. A library is one of the best means of enabling the ambitious to repair the defects in their early training.

Thomas Edison, the great inventor, stands out in most people's minds as a type of man capable of original thought, with wonderful natural ability to see what others have overlooked. Yet his biographers tell us that before Edison begins independent research he invariably reads everything bearing upon the matter in hand.

The pace of modern progress is largely due to the fact that through preserving a printed record knowledge once gained is retained and serves as a foundation for further advance.

A city which fails to provide a central reservoir of books is denying its ablest minds the tools with which to work.

Rochester should and must have a central library.

Times-Herald March 17, 1923 Would Put Central Library At South Ave. And Court St.; Scholastic Gothic In Style

Assemblyman Adler Suggests Tall, Rather Narrow Building Like the D. & H. Building in Albany— Would Have Light From All Sides and Make Unnecessary Purchase of Land by City.

Everyone is talking Central Library nowadays and the latest and one of the best suggestions on the subject came today from Simon L. Adler, Republican leader in the Assembly, who is back in the city from Albany for a flying week-end trip.

Should Mr. Adler's suggestions materialize the Central Library will be situated at Court street and South avenue and will be a tall, rather narrow building in the scholastic Gothic style of architecture, of which the D. & H. building in Albany is one of the finest examples in the country.

"I can see many advantages in this plan," said Mr. Adler discussing the matter with a reporter for The Times-Union this morning. "There is first and foremost the fact that such a site would be central, probably as central as any site which could be picked in the city. It would face directly on the new street and the people of this city don't yet realize what a wonderful thoroughfare that new street is going to be."

"Facing on the river across the new boulevard the building would have a splendid outlook and plenty of light, all the more as the city's present plans of course include the widening of South avenue."

"There is no doubt that a beautiful building, a building which would be a credit to the city and to the citizens and a structure of architectural significance, could be put up on this site."

The scholastic Gothic style lends itself admirably to the tall narrow building which is becoming more and more essential in our crowded cities where there is not sufficient room for the Greek and Roman classical styles which demand great space for proper appreciation.

"I can see a great library building in this style, surmounted perhaps by a tower, the whole blending harmoniously to beautify one of the spots in the city which now is sadly in need of some beautification. It would be an ornament to what will probably become the city's finest down town street, and will have on one side at least, absolute freedom from the enforcement of other buildings. All this on a site which now belongs to the city."

"I put forward the idea for what it is worth and to stimulate general discussion of the subject among the people. The more they talk over the different plans which may be advanced the more interest they will take in seeing that the best possible plan is agreed upon eventually."

Mr. Adler declined to be quoted regarding his plan until the consent of Mayor Van Zandt had been obtained and when this was asked, Mr. Van Zandt said:

"Go ahead, go ahead, the more there is in the papers and in the conversation of the people about the central library, wherever it is situated, the better off we shall all be."

Gives Principles To Guide Choice Of New Library Site

Times - N. March 22, 1913

Librarian Yust Says Building Should Be Object Lesson in Architecture—Should Be Accessible, Should Have Dignified Setting and Approach—Rochester Is Behind Every Large City in Country in This Respect.

City Librarian Charles F. Yust, in the following letter to The Times-Union, sets forth some pertinent facts to be considered in connection with the proposed new central library:

"The attention which the central library is at present receiving prompts me to state a few principles which should guide in the selection of a site. In the first place due consideration should be given to the strong influence which the architecture of public buildings has on the ideas and ideals of the people. This applies especially to a library on account of the nature of its contents. We call it the dwelling place of books, the products of the master minds of the ages, and we refer to the public library as the people's university.

"The library building therefore should be an object lesson in architecture, beautiful, dignified, impressive, permanent. It should give the impression that it is an educational institution, not only identified with the instruction and development of the people and giving daily assistance to those who use it but also standing for all that is noblest and best in the life of the community.

"It should be located where it will best fulfill its purposes. In locating it the following points should be considered:

"1. Accessibility. It should be near the center of the population to be served. It should be remembered also that this center of population may

be on or near the great thoroughfare or thoroughfares of the city. Nearness to intersecting street car lines is desirable, though if they are too near, the noise will interfere.

"2. Approach. Sufficient ground on all sides is desirable, but especially in front to provide a dignified setting and approach. There are library buildings, however, which adjoin the sidewalk. This has the advantage of greater convenience to passers-by and affords better advertising possibilities, but it detracts from the architectural effect. Distance is necessary to the appreciation of a monumental building such as the library should be.

"3. Light and air. The location should be high and dry with ample space around it to admit an abundance of natural light and fresh air. This forbids the nearness of high buildings or large chimneys emitting heavy smoke or gases.

"4. Growth. There should be room for addition to the building without marring its architectural appearance or impairing its administration.

"5. Residence section or business. It may be in either section or on the boundary line between the two. Most of the large cities of the country have chosen the residence portion probably because there is a suitable site was more easily available or they have compromised on an intermediate location. But the idea is gaining ground that the library is most useful close to the street in the very heart of the retail business section, because there it makes a stronger appeal to the man in the street than it does in a residence section at a secluded distance from the passing throng. This is one way of bringing the library to the attention of the people and projecting it into their daily thought. This principle has had much weight in locating some of our present branch library quarters.

"6. Relation to other buildings. It is desirable for it to stand on its own ground, to be independent of other buildings and institutions, such as the city hall, a school, a business house, etc. This adds to its appearance, ease of administration and safety from fire. It may well be one of a group of public buildings, such as a school, a church, an art gallery, as in the modern civic center. The position it occupies among such buildings has an important effect on the position it occupies in the minds of the people.

"7. Cost of land. In securing a library site the cost of land is an important factor, which may have a modifying influence on any of these points. The opportunity for Rochester to obtain a suitable library site cheap is gone forever. It is still possible to obtain a good site, but it will cost money and a good round sum. It should be the best the city can afford. On the other hand the city can afford the best. It should not be content with anything else.

"The city of Rochester does not possess a single building erected for library purposes. In this respect it is behind every other large city in the

country, and behind many of the small villages in this state. Having waited so long for this important public improvement, it should insist on a building that will be a model from the standpoint of architecture and administration and usefulness. Such a building will be possible only on a site especially selected for that purpose."

More Branches Needed.

"The library needs are threefold, more branches, better branches and a central library," the report adds. "Instead of ten branches we should have fifteen. The other five are needed in the following sections: The Park avenue section of the Twelfth ward; the Seneca parkway section of the Tenth ward; the Culver road section of the Eighteenth ward; the Clinton avenue section of the north half of the Seventeenth ward; the Highland Park section of all of the Fourteenth ward. For twelve years these sections have been paying for branch libraries in other parts of the city but have had none of their own.

"By better branches is meant real library buildings. They do not need to be temples of learning, but they should at least bear the stamp of respectability. They might well be object lessons in architecture, expressive of what is noblest and best in the life of the community. No citizen of Rochester can point with pride to its library buildings. Of the ten established branches, four are in old city buildings which have been remodeled and adapted and six are in rented quarters.

"A central library is the outstanding need of Rochester to-day. Rochester is unique in this defect. It is the only large city in the United States without a central library. This is true not only for cities of its own size but even for cities as small as 100,000. For years we took some comfort from the fact that in this defect Albany was also in our class. Now even Albany has spurred our lazy complacency, leaving Rochester solitary and alone in its indifference to this great educational institution.

There is a wide-spread conviction that the establishment of a central library should not be delayed longer but should be started now. Accordingly there has been included in the library's budget requests for next year an item of \$37,000, with which to begin a Central Library Service. This amount added to our maintenance appropriation of last year would make our per capita allowance only six cents. This is a modest sum in view of what other cities are doing, modest in view of the city's ability and very modest in view of Rochester's boasted pre-eminence in other respects. In the words of Charles H. White, president of the board of trustees: "A Central Library in 1923."

The Library Site.

Dec. March 26-1913.

The city should act at once to acquire an adequate site for a central library. The Mayor has recommended action and action is demanded by common sense, for the longer the city waits the higher price it will be obliged to pay.

Quick action should not prevent the city getting a site that is wholly adequate, however, and the conditions of a wholly adequate site were admirably set forth by the City Librarian in a statement published in this paper last Friday. Accepting his conditions, since Mr. Yust is recognized as one of the best qualified public librarians in the country, public sentiment should at once be directed to actual selection.

Arnold Brunner and Frederick Law Olmstead in 1911 suggested the east side of North Union street, between Main street east and University avenue, facing Anderson Park. Their suggestion has not been improved upon, since the site is near the center of the city's population, is served by car lines on two main streets and faces a park which affords an adequate approach to a building of noble architecture such as the library must be. Part of this site, however, has been acquired for a large apartment house, so that the city must move quickly if it is to acquire it.

The east side of Franklin Square also has been suggested. With the contemplated street improvements in that section completed, it would well serve the purpose.

The Convention Hall site is another possibility. This would be peculiarly appropriate if the library was made a memorial library, since the hall was reconstructed out of the old arsenal and faces the Civil war monument.

The abandonment of the University's plans for further building on the present campus makes possible the erection of a central library there flanking the Memorial Art Gallery, a suggestion in many ways admirable since with the inevitable further eastward moving of the city's center of population the site will for some years increase in convenience.

Other sites may be suggested, but all should be considered with Mr. Yust's conditions in mind. Those who have ideas on the subject are invited to make them known at once through the Democrat and Chronicle, for action on the project should be taken at once. If the site selected is ill placed or in other ways inadequate the whole city of the future will suffer.

Central Library Project Discussed At Round-Table

Women's City Club Adopts Resolutions, Offering Co-operation—Dr. John R. Slater Says Some of Proposals Are Impractical—Leroy Snyder Declares Picking of Right Site Is Important.

Through the efforts of the Women's City Club, a group of prominent citizens of Rochester were secured as speakers last evening at the round-table discussion of the central library project, held in the clubrooms in Chestnut street.

In addition to the talks, members of the club moved to adopt the following two resolutions: "1.—Resolved, that it is desirable to bring into conference on the central library project representatives of all interested groups, including the Rochester Public Library, Reynolds' Library and those charged with the administration of the Rundel fund, and that the chairman of this meeting be empowered to appoint a committee to further such a conference and advance Resolved, that this group congratulates the Mayor of the City of Rochester upon his public stand on behalf of a central library, and that we offer our co-operation in furthering the project."

The discussion was opened by Dr. John R. Slater, head of the English department of the University of Rochester, who said, in part:

Does Rochester need a central public library? Yes; but not for the reasons usually advanced, nor in the degree usually represented nor on the basis some times proposed.

The question whether the city of Rochester should at this time take steps leading toward the erection of a central library in or near the business district has been complicated by unsound advocacy and impracticable proposals. Among the reasons advanced for such a plan is the claim that there is in Rochester no collection of reference books adequate for study and research. It is alleged that persons desiring information on such subjects as chemistry, electrical engineering, soap-making, architecture, cannot find what they want in Rochester, because there is no central public library. Such a statement shows an ignorance of the contents of the Reynolds and University libraries which should not exist among librarians or students. There are fields in which neither the Reynolds nor the University library is adequate for advanced or technical research; but they are not fields likely to be more extensively covered at an early date by a central public library.

All such departments as general literature, biography, travel, history, memoirs, the more expensive and less popular books which the Public Library branches cannot afford to supply are already available to the public in the Reynolds Library for both references and circulation use. In the University Library such scientific material, and large special collections in history and some other time for reference, though circulation privileges are for the most part necessarily limited to members of the university.

These two libraries together with those of the Rochester Theological Seminary and the Eastman School of Music, contain nearly 250,000 volumes. When the collections of this size are available to students and serious readers, supplementing the admirable work of the Public Library branches and stations in the larger fields, it would not seem that there is really a book famine in Rochester.

On the other hand, a central public library is nevertheless desirable, books alone do not make a library. Service, that kind of service that goes out into the community and interests the public in good reading, is indispensable. The Reynolds Library, as the University Library, for different reasons, cannot perform this kind of advertising and publicity service as effectively as could a central public library.

One reason why the Reynolds Library is not today filling the position in the community to which its fine collection of books should entitle it is that during the past 25 years it has had to pay out to the city in taxes on the Reynolds Arcade, \$145,431.20, with county taxes to the additional amount of \$21,249.45. If this sum of \$176,680.65 could have been expended on books and library service, there would now be little need to talk about the lack of a central library. Inasmuch as the Arcade is not rented for private profit but solely for the support of the Reynolds Library, the wisdom and expediency of such a tax on education may well be questioned. It is true that the taxation of the Arcade (less an exemption for the reading-room maintained there) is based on a state law forbidding the exemption of any income-producing property, even though owned by educational or benevolent corporations; but the passage of that state law is said to have been due to the shrewdness of certain owners of Rochester office-buildings a generation ago.

Because of limited funds, therefore, the Reynolds Library has been forced to turn on propaganda for good reading. It has simply said to the public, "The books are here, if you are willing to walk a couple of blocks from the main street, to get to the modern idea that Main street will not come to the books, the books must be carried to Main street. Since most people do not go, of their way to get a new edition, the Public Library under modern conditions must do more than merely private books, must 'sell the proposition.' It must create both supply and demand. And this is why Rochester needs a central library—for a publicity service, a propaganda, centering in a handsome building in a commanding geographical position, which cannot be expected from the existing reference libraries of the city.

Yet the need is not so pressing that the city should be rapidly approaching its debt limit and limit of taxation, should undertake so expensive a project at this time. So long as we cannot afford to make more than two or three streets passable for wheeled vehicles for two months of the winter, so long as hundreds of school children are housed in portable frame huts, it is premature to talk of a central library as an undertaking for the immediate future.

But there are some who see an easy way out of this financial difficulty. They propose combining the Rundel bequest with the Reynolds Library funds for the erection, either on the present site or elsewhere, of a city library building. So stated, the proposal is apparently incompatible with the terms of the Reynolds will, though not of Rundel's. Mr. Reynolds provided with great care against the possibility of having his library become at any future time the football of city politics. He wished it to be a public institution in the sense of being open safeguards of its control. To combine his estate with the Rundel fund in the erection of a building to which the name "Rundel Memorial building" must be attached, and to turn over this building to the control of city administration, would seem to be a clear violation of trust for which the Reynolds Library trustees are not likely to become responsible.

A solution of the problem will have to be reached as always in such cases, by a process of conservative compromise. At some time in the future, when the city of Rochester, with the Rundel fund supplemented by a bond issue of another million, is able to purchase a suitable site and erect a central library worthy of the city, it is entirely possible that the Reynolds Library funds, or a part of them, might be devoted under the permanent supervision of the Reynolds trustees, to the maintenance of a Reynolds Reference Library closely co-ordinated with the public library system. It is true that similar legal difficulties have been surmounted in library mergers in New York and elsewhere. Some arrangement will undoubtedly be reached here when the time comes. The time has not yet arrived, because the city has not the money to spend.

Meanwhile it is the privilege, perhaps the duty of public library employees to direct their patrons to existing reference libraries for books not in their own branches. And it is the privilege and pleasure of all good citizens to recognize and applaud the excellent work of the public library branches in carrying on during the past eleven years an efficient circulation service and laying the foundations for a comprehensive public library system for the future. In order that this future may not be too distant, it is well that the present discussion should be continued.

The related question of a suitable site for a central library has immediate present importance in view of the changes brought about by the approaching completion of the subway and the advancing cost of land near the center of the city. A site should be secured without delay; and before it can be selected somebody must answer the baffling question, "Where is to be the future center of the city?" Whether the Rundel bequest could properly be used for a public library building in view of the apparent intent of the testator to found an institution for the fine arts is a question that has been no means settled. It is true that the phrase in his will is "for the purpose of a library and fine arts building for the use of all the people of Rochester." On the other hand, Mr. Rundel was interested in popular and local artists, not in books. Those who knew him say that what he probably had in mind was a building where Rochester artists might have studios, a gallery for the exhibition of their best pictures, a library perhaps chiefly devoted to art, an assembly hall for their meetings, and so on. Now, since the erection of the Memorial Art Gallery, Rochester does not need another gallery for the display of loan exhibitions or for the housing of a permanent gift collection of pictures. But Rochester still needs a home for artists, a place where they can paint and model and show their work to the public, a center for the more intimate teaching of painting and sculpture such as goes on in the studios of the larger cities. This encouragement for the artistic life of the city cannot be permanently centered either at the Memorial Art Gallery or for various reasons which it is not necessary to elaborate.

The suggestion has been made that the most fitting use for Mr. Rundel's gift would be to purchase with such a gift a building suitable for such an art center—for example, the Kimball place in Troup street, which is now available, and to provide a generous endowment for the upkeep of the institution under the joint control of the Rundel trustees and the artists. Rochester with its art gallery, its conservatories and fine grounds, its costly interior decorations, would make a home for the arts, which is no less a rank Rochester among the art centers of the country. There is no reason why, with such an equipment, reputation and sculpture of national reputation might come here to work and to teach advanced pupils; no reason why such artistic activity as now exists in cities like Pittsburgh and Cleveland might be naturally gravitate to Rochester. Then, with such a Rundel Memorial and with the Eastman School of Music, we should have a well-rounded provision for the higher life of the city, co-ordinated with the central library which is sure to come, sooner or later, chiefly from the pockets of taxpayers. To do more such a plan is not to deny the need of a central library; it is only to encourage the mature consideration of the steps of far-reaching importance are taken."

Leroy Snyder, in answering the assertion made by Dr. Slater that Rochester has reached its debt limit, declared that all growing cities are at their debt limit, and if they were not they would be backward and unprogressive. "Every city," said Mr. Snyder, "that wants something very badly goes after it, and if the people of Rochester want a central library the way to get it can be found." Mr. Snyder then discussed the site of such a library and, disagreeing with Edward Hungerford, who suggested a makeshift until the financial condition of the city justified the erection of a central library worthy of the city, he declared that it would be better to pay a half a million for the right site than to get the university site for nothing, as suggested by Mr. Hungerford, if it were not the right site.

Others who entered into the discussion were: Algernon Crapsey, City Librarian William F. Yust, Clinton Wunder and Edward Hungerford.

ORPHAN HOME HEAD WRITES FOR LIBRARY

Armand Wyle Offers Hope That City Will Take Up Eastman Offer and That It May Lead to Central Library.

Armand Wyle, superintendent of Jewish Orphan Home at 1,170 Genesee street, offers the hope in a letter written yesterday to Mayor Van Zandt that the city will take up George Eastman's offer of the former Cluett-Peabody factory building as a temporary city hall and that eventually this will lead to the much hoped-for central library.

My Dear Mayor Van Zandt: There seems to be a general hope expressed by many prominent citizens with whom I come in contact, that the city will accept Mr. Eastman's magnificent offer of the old Cluett-Peabody building for the use of city departments and officials.

One of the uses to which many of us look for relief is the beginning of a central library, the absence of which has long been felt to be inconsistent with the otherwise widely known progressive spirit of our city. There are very few cities of our size and civic consciousness that have no central library where students, whether graduates or undergraduates of college, can go for literary, artistic or professional research and find books of reference which our inadequate scheme of branch libraries makes impossible because of the expense of duplication in each. It is prohibitive under our present system to purchase books much above the popular tests and demand, except to a minor degree at the business branch devoted to only a single phase of study.

It would seem that with the prospective growth of our university, that something must be done soon to relieve this anomalous situation, and it also appears that Mr. Eastman has again laid the foundation for the consummation of another ideal for our wonderful city, if only we will accept his offer.

Because of library facilities in other cities in which I have lived and worked, I miss the practical assistance which means so much to those who must obtain their information from original sources, and I respectfully urge you and your colleagues in the administration of Rochester to embrace this opportunity if for no other reason than its potential provision of our long-wished for central library and the service to our citizens which only a central library can give.

Very sincerely yours,
Armand Wyle.

A Central Library Site.

Suggestion of the site between Court street bridge and the new Aqueduct boulevard for location of a central library brings proper realization of this important civic project decidedly nearer. *Times 26 June 14, 1923*

That the land already is owned by the city is the first and most obvious advantage. Purchase of a site having anything like the same advantages with reference to location near the center of population and important transfer points would involve great expense.

Rochester needs a central library which will serve as a storehouse for a much larger collection of books than can be housed in any branch library. Such a library, by affording means for acquiring information along different lines and covering the field of good literature in a reasonably adequate fashion is the crown and capstone of the educational system of a large city.

Nearly every other city approaching the size of Rochester has such a library. Here such books as we have are scattered, with many duplications in lines where proper service would mean concentration of purchases and a more extensive and down-to-date collection.

If the city can take the initiative by providing a proper site it is to be hoped that some such combination of existing funds and foundations as has been worked out successfully in other cities can be effected here. The Rundel fund and the Reynolds library foundation come to mind at once in this connection.

Ultimate test of the value of a library is the number of readers and the extent to which they are benefited.

So far as the number of readers is concerned the argument for a location as central and as easily accessible as possible is conclusive.

Quality of service is the main argument for a large library. Only by the aid of such a collection properly housed, can those who wish to "dig into" a subject and make extensive use of books for cultural, scientific and business purposes properly be served.

In addition to the advantages of present city possession and central location this site will give plenty of light and air on all sides. Its area of 320 by 200 feet is ample. There are said to be no engineering difficulties.

Let us hope the proposal to reserve this plot will mark real progress toward a central library worthy of Rochester.

Rochester Library Project Described By Simon L. Adler In Talk Before Lions Club

Site on River Front, on Property Acquired by City as Result of Erie Canal Purchase—Location Ideal for Erection of Great Central Library With Opportunity for Expansion if Found Necessary.

The Rochester Public Library project, its history and present status, were described by Assemblyman Simon L. Adler of 17 Argyle street, in an address before the Lions Club at the Hotel Rochester this noon. Mr. Adler has been closely connected with the plans of the library committee for the erection of a central library to serve the entire city, and made clear just how far preparations for such a building have progressed.

Actual plans for erecting the library have not as yet been started, but the site of the building has been selected, and as soon as funds for construction are obtained, work on the proposed building will commence. Mr. Adler's remarks, briefly, were as follows:

"A city library has two principal purposes; the first is adequately to provide for the current reading of the community, and the second is to serve as a reservoir for the knowledge of the ages. In Rochester, the development of the public library system in establishing branch libraries throughout the city has been calculated to fill the first function. The other, and perhaps more important function can be fulfilled only by the establishment of a large, central library.

"Probably no other city of this size in the country is without a great central library. Rochester has a great many books available for reference, but these are to be found principally in the libraries of the University of Rochester and the Theological Seminary, and in the Reynolds Library; these are open to the general public, but are not easily available.

"For some time past, it has been a subject for the thoughtful consideration of many persons, to determine when and where a central library should be erected. A number of sites were proposed. Finally, after the city acquired from the State of New York the abandoned Erie Canal, and when this property was utilized for the new subway which is now in course of construction, and for a new street paralleling Main street to the south, and crossing the river over the old aqueduct, it was found that the city owned a comparatively large area situated directly in the center of the business district, an area available for the erection of a building or buildings of large size.

"Measurements made by the city engineer showed that in the area between South avenue Courtstreet the 'new' street and the east bank of the river there was a space 200 feet wide, and 320 feet long which could be utilized for a great public building. It was then suggested to 'Charles H. Wiltse'



ASSEMBLYMAN SIMON L. ADLER.

Wiltse chairman of the library board, that this would be an ideal site for the great central library for which the city had been waiting. Mr. Wiltse immediately saw the advantages of the location and made a study of the problem with the result that the library board has requested the city to set aside this site for the purpose.

"The space set aside is large enough for a building even of great size, which can be erected along the river bank, leaving sufficient space for a plaza between the building and South avenue. It is also large enough to provide space for any expansion of the building which may later be required.

"The location is ideal in that it is practically in the center of the city. It is so situated as to make it easy to reach in two or three minutes from any part of the business or financial section; it will also be at one of the main stations of the subway which is soon to become an important part of the city's transportation facilities.

"It will be a structure of such artistic merits and intrinsic beauty as persons unfamiliar with the plans have no conception of. The location will assist in beautifying the river front, an opportunity which should eagerly be taken advantage of, as similar opportunities have been in the past.

"On the whole, the location of a great public library on this site will be a tremendous advantage to Rochester, both as an artistic and as an educational feature of the city's facilities."

Project For City Central Library Furthered At Meeting Of Trustees

BUILDING WOULD OVERLOOK RIVER AND BOULEVARD

Common Council Petitioned
To Set Aside Site Sug-
gested by Simon Adler,
Who Also Recommends
Type of Architecture.

The project of erecting a municipal Central Library at Court street and South avenue received great impetus when the Public Library Board petitioned the Common Council last night to set aside the proposed location which is owned by the city for library purposes.

The proposed site is bounded by Court street, South avenue and the new boulevard over the old Erie canal and the Genesee river. It is proposed to build the library over the Johnson-Seymour race. The site, which is worth half a million, will cost nothing. The type of building which the trustees of the Public Library have in mind, would cost about \$1,000,000, of which the city already has about \$400,000 left to the municipality by the Rundel estate.

Assemblyman Simon L. Adler, whose original idea it was to build a Central Library on the site recommended by the Library Board, was delighted by the action taken by the trustees. Mr. Adler's idea was published exclusively in The Times-Union some time ago. Mr. Adler suggested that the architecture be of the Collegiate or Tudor Gothic, modeled somewhat on the famous Delaware and Hudson Railroad office building in Albany, and architects are preparing sketches of a proposed building along these lines.

It is not likely, however, that plans or even the style of architecture for the building will be agreed upon at this time. City Librarian William F. Yust said this morning that invitations would probably be sent out to architects all over the country asking them to submit sketches for a building that would best suit the unusual site.

The Public Library Board of Trustees which petitioned the Common Council to set aside the site for library purposes is composed of Charles H. Wiltse, president; Mayor Van Zandt, ex-officio; Dr. Rush Rhees, Edward G. Miner, Mrs. Constance Hickey, Dr. Clarence A. Barbour, Charles F. Wray and William F. Yust, secretary and city librarian.

Mr. Yust has described the site as follows:

City Librarian William F. Yust describes the river site for the Rochester, Public Library in this manner.

It is on South avenue between Court street and the new boulevard which is being built over the old Erie canal aqueduct. It is opposite the Osburn House between South avenue and the river. It is only two minutes' walk from Main street, the present greatest thoroughfare of the city. It is right in the new subway and boulevard, the future great thoroughfare of the city. It is on South avenue, the leading north and south street east of the river. It is only four minutes' walk from State and Exchange, the leading north and south streets west of the river.



—Photo by Times-Union Photographer.
Proposed site of municipal Central Library at Court street and South avenue.

Where the above mentioned streets intersect will be the great transfer points of transportation. This will remain true, no matter where the center of population may go. The proposed site adjoins this transfer area. Therefore it could hardly be better located with reference to accessibility. Rochester has an east side and a west side and will always have them as long as the Genesee river flows through the city. In years past scores of people have asked me where in my judgment the Central Library should be located. My answer has been that it should be either on the east side or on the west side of the river. That answer was always accepted with a laugh except once, when someone said, "Why not put it on top of the river. It is a perfect solution of the problem of east and west side so far as it applies to the Central Library."

There is no place anywhere near the center of the city which offers such splendid possibilities for a beautiful, stately building, the finest and most impressive specimen of architecture in the city. There is a space there 320 feet long and 200 feet wide with streets on three sides and the river on the fourth side. This gives sufficient space on all sides for a dignified setting and approach. In order to appreciate the full sweep of the approach from the south, for example, it is necessary to imagine that all existing buildings have been removed between South avenue and the river south of Court street. These buildings are all owned by the city and will shortly be removed. This will further increase the appropriateness of this river site for a monumental building.

Light and air are of fundamental importance. The open space around the building will be ample to admit an abundance of natural light and fresh air. There will even be room for some lawn and shrubbery and at least from one side there will be no dust unless the river runs dry.

Growth. Another established principle is that there should be room for addition to the building without marring its architectural appearance or impairing its administration. There is sufficient area here for several buildings which would be large enough for a hundred years. A type of building could be adopted consisting of a number of units. These units could be erected one at a time as they are needed. This method however, would be less likely to produce the best results for the time being and ultimately than to erect a finished structure at once, complete and final. The second alternative would yield more room than is at once needed for library purposes. It has been suggested therefore that any surplus room could be temporarily utilized for other city departments with the understanding that the space so occupied is to be vacated as the library grows and has need for additional room.

Cost of land. The high cost of land is generally the chief obstacle in securing an ideal site for a central library. The larger the city, the more difficult this problem becomes. To buy a site on Main street similar in size and location to the proposed river site would cost \$3,000,000. The City of Rochester is not in position at present to pay such a sum for this purpose, at least that is the opinion of those who are in charge of its financial affairs. The river site has an estimated real estate value of \$500,000, and it will not cost a cent, because the city already owns it. The cost of constructing piers, walls, arches, etc., over the subway and the edge of the river will not be greater than the cost of excavating would be on another site. The city engineer has made a study of the various construction problems involved, and he states that there are no engineering difficulties in the way.

Residence or business section. Two distinct and opposing ideas exist with regard to the proper location of a library. One selects a retired, secluded spot, preferably in a grove, and posed to favor for her habitation. Such spots naturally are to be found only in the residential districts. Some of

the large public libraries of the country have been located with a tendency in this direction. The most recent and notable example of this kind is the Detroit Public Library opened last year.

The other idea, and this is gaining ground, is that the library is most useful close to the street in the very heart of the business section, because there it makes a stronger appeal to all the people than it does in a residence section apart from the passing throng. A great, impressive building on this river site will be a powerful means of bringing the library to the attention of the people and projecting it into their daily thought.

Letters From Readers Times-Union June 29, 1923 Opposes River Site

For Central Library

Editor, Times-Union:

Before the location for the new library building is decided, I would like to make my protest against the proposed river site. The only recommendation the site has, is, it is owned by the city.

It would be noisy, being near the subway, damp, and there would be all the odors from the river. The view from all directions (except, perhaps, the South) would be anything but picturesque, the building would be hidden out of sight—strangers would have to inquire for it. It should be located in the most beautiful and traveled street in the city, which is East avenue, opposite Gibbs street. This site would be convenient to the Eastman School of Music, the Y. M. C. A., the Women's College and a rapidly growing business center. The architecture should approach the style of the Memorial Art Gallery.

If the city is saddled with a monstrosity, such as was depicted in a late morning paper, and on the contemplated site the people of Rochester will always regret that they did not rise up in protest before it was too late. I think the question is too important to be decided hastily. I think the people of Rochester—not a few men—should have a voice in the decision, either by some kind of popular vote or public mass meeting. There are any number of sites preferable to the one chosen.

Never mind the cost—have a building the city will always be proud of and on the most conspicuous site.

C. G. Huntington.

Lions' Club Endorses Site For Central Library After Suggestion Of Assemblyman

Times-Union, June 29, 1923

Following a talk on the Rochester Central Library project, given by Assemblyman Simon L. Adler before the Lions' Club at the Hotel Rochester yesterday noon, that organization heartily endorsed the site suggested by Mr. Adler, and adopted the slogan "A Central Library in 1925."

Mr. Adler, who had been the first to suggest the river site for the proposed structure, explained the history of the project, and pointed out the advantages of the suggested location for Rochester's central library.

After the address, the members of the Lions' Club unanimously passed the following resolution:

Resolved: That the Lions' Club cordial approval to the site suggested by the Board of Trustees of the Rochester Public Library for a central library building at the corner of Court street and South avenue and expresses confident opinion to the mayor of the city and to the board of trustees that such site will fully meet the highest and best requirements for the location of a central and reference library so greatly needed by our city of quality and that we endorse for co-operation in every proper manner the slogan, "A Central

Library in 1925."

This resolution was amplified by an explanatory statement advancing four principal reasons for favoring the proposed site, between South avenue, Court street the "new" street, and the east bank of the river:

1—It obviates the investment of from \$500,000 to \$750,000 for a site.

2—It is as centrally located as could be for all interests; the east side, the west side, the business center, the retail district; it is near the center of population; it is situated upon what will be Rochester's main artery of traffic, namely the subway and the new boulevard.

3—In addition to the now existing arteries of traffic approaching this site and those under construction, another wonderful development is bound to come. With the city purchasing the land between the subway and South avenue and the already existing barge canal harbor approaches between Court and Clarissa street, there only remains the construction of the proposed boulevard approach to the new University site along the river from Clarissa street to Elmwood avenue.

4—A central library on the river site could naturally develop into a civic center because of the natural river surroundings. What wonderful possibilities this opens for the future civic development of our city.

CITY TO MAINTAIN RIGHTS IN RIVER SITE FOR LIBRARY UNTIL BETTER LOCATION IS OFFERED

The city of Rochester under no circumstances will relinquish its interest in the site caused by the intersection of South avenue, Court street and the new thoroughfare until it is definitely established there is a more advantageous library site, it was stated yesterday afternoon at the City Hall. The Common Council has before it a communication from the Library Board asking the council to see that the river site is reserved for the public library. No formal action was taken by the council, but it is stated, nothing will be done to give up the site until it is shown that there is a better library site.

Interest in the location of the public library at South avenue, Court street and the new subway street, was stimulated by the gossip that the Rochester Gas and Electric Corporation was considering the erection of an office building there. Herman Russell, vice-president and general manager of the Rochester Gas and Electric Corporation, declared yesterday that the corporation never seri-

ously considered the South avenue site for an office building and said that if the city should select it as the location for the new library, the corporation, which controlled water rights in the race, will co-operate in the project.

It was pointed out that the city is in no position to finance the construction of a public library at this time, but it was stated in no uncertain terms that the South avenue site would not slip away from control of the city. There are said to be many proponents of a plan to erect the public library on the extension of University avenue at Franklin square, it being argued that this site is superior to that recommended by the Library Board.

Discussion of sites for the library, also for the new city hall, can necessarily be only one of speculation, as it is pointed out, the city's finances will not permit any such improvements at this time, in view of the heavy demands on city coffers by the Department of Public Instruction.

COUNCIL URGED TO SAVE LIBRARY SITE

Librarian Calls Attention to River Project.

A communication has been addressed to members of the Common Council by William F. Yust, librarian of the Rochester Public Library, urging that the site at South avenue, Court street and the new subway street be saved for the proposed Central Library to be erected in the future. This site has been mentioned as the possible location of the new office building of the Rochester Gas and Electric Corporation.

The communication is as follows:

The newspapers report that the Gas and Electric Corporation is planning a large office building on the site chosen for the Central Library building. In this choice the corporation is showing good judgment, equal to that shown by the Board of Trustees of the Rochester Public Library.

Permit me to recall that in June of last year the library trustees at a meeting held in the mayor's office passed a resolution respectfully requesting the Common Council temporarily to set aside that site for a Central Library. Though the Council has not yet acted on that request, the reaction among the people of the city was practically unanimous in its favor.

Rochester is the only city of its size in the United States without a Central Library. For a century untold water power has swept through the city unused. The lack of a library has done the same for the great stream of books that pours from the presses of the world. To-day we are spending millions of dollars on public improvements, millions on public schools, millions on college and university education, but for a library we have no funds. Here is a site to be had practically by a declaration of purpose without the sale of bonds or a financial campaign.

It is a magnificent site the most central and suitable to be found anywhere in the city. It is too valuable to be idle. The time has come for it to be put to work. What shall it be, an office building or a library building? That it has been reserved these hundred years and is still available for a public library seems almost providential. It must not now be lost by default.

There is still time for the council to act and by acting to co-operate with the Library Board, the Gas and Electric Corporation, the public and everybody concerned in retaining that site for a great public library worthy of the city of Rochester.

A CENTRAL LIBRARY

One of Rochester's greatest needs suggests my theme for next Sunday night (November 19th) at the Baptist Temple. We will also offer a delightful program of music and songs.

If you believe "Education is the handmaid of Religion," come and help us build "A Central Library" sentiment. The teachers and librarians of Rochester will be our special guests.

Clinton Wunder.

P. S. We cannot guarantee seats after 7:30 P. M.

LIBRARY PLAN IS PROPOSED BY VAN ZANDT

D+C. March 19, 1923

**Suggests Combining Rundel
Requests with Reynolds**

**Library Resources.
CUT IMPROVEMENTS**

**Urges Sacrifice of All But
Imperative Works to
Canal-bed Project.**

The delay of all except imperative purely local improvements until the industrial and rapid-transit railroad project is completed and the establishment of a central public library are urged by Mayor Van Zandt in his 1922-1923 message presented to the Common Council last night.

Sufficient money is not available for carrying on the year's program of local improvement work and finishing the canal railroad. The Mayor believes the benefit which will accrue to the city at large from the canal development is sufficient to warrant the sidetracking of all except local improvements absolutely necessary.

Central Library Needed.

The need of a read central library and the extension of the branch system is emphasized by the Mayor. While he points out that the present condition of the city's finances precludes any immediate construction of such a building, he recommends that a proper site be provided and that a building fund be provided by combining the Rundel fund and the Reynolds library fund, if possible, and that a definite proposal be made to the Reynolds Library to co-operate with the city in the establishment and maintenance of a central library.

The Mayor expresses his deep appreciation for the co-operation and support given him by the aldermen and members of his cabinet. He states that while he is pleased that a real start has been made toward reduction of administrative costs, still further economies must be exercised during the coming year.

Chief Sections of Message.

The main portion of the message follows:

Rochester, N. Y.
To the Honorable, the Common Council of
the City of Rochester:
Gentlemen:

In compliance with the provisions of the city charter, I hereby transmit to your honorable body my annual message, embodying the required statement as to city finances and a brief review of the administrative work of the past year with such recommendations for the ensuing year as seem advisable.

In this connection I desire to express my deep appreciation that has been given me by your honorable body and the heads of the various departments and bureaus during the past twelve months, at the same time asking a continuance of that co-operation during the ensuing year that our city may not be halted in its progress.

Record Improvement Year.

The year 1922 established a record in the matter of public improvements, a record that not only serves to maintain the high standard set for Rochester in years past but points to even greater advancement in the years to come. Notably is this so in the matter of the commencement upon the plan for the utilization and development of the abandoned Erie canal lands which were acquired by the city early last year. The importance of this improvement, it seems to me, can scarcely be overestimated and we are only beginning to realize its possibilities now that the actual work of construction is under way.

First payment to the state for the lands was made on January 10th and that gave the city the right of entry upon the property. This was followed by the advertisement for bids and letting of the contract for the first section of the work, construction of the subway and overhead thoroughfare between South avenue and a point west of Oak street. Actual construction was begun on May 2d and has been carried forward since that time. The contract for this part of the development is scheduled to be completed November 1, 1923, and that the city may begin to realize the benefit of the improvement as soon after that date as possible. I strongly urge early start upon the remaining sections, more especially that to the east of the contract now under way.

Must Finish East Section.

The completion of the easterly section will be necessary to make really available the use of the section now under construction. Such completion will permit the removal of the interurban trolley cars entering the city from the east and now operating upon the local surface line tracks, and the removal of the larger and heavier cars from the city's streets will mean greater facility in operation for both local and interurban lines.

The financial demands for the carrying on of the canal lands development will necessitate delay in some other projects of more purely local character, and I urge that no local improvement ordinances be adopted by your honorable body except those that are imperative. Ordinances for the development of new subdivisions should be eliminated so far as possible for this year. Such developments should, in my opinion, be financed by the owners of the property to be developed. The benefit which is to accrue to the city at large from the canal lands developments, it seems to me, should mitigate any sense of disappointment resulting from the postponement of more purely local improvements.

Bonds Sell Well.

Twice during the past fourteen months the financial stability of the city has been borne witness to by extremely advantageous terms obtained for city bonds, issued in a large measure, to replace short term outstanding obligations.

Further progress has been made during the past year toward the complete motorization of the freighting force. Through substitutions of motor-driven for horse-drawn equipment Rochester's freighting equipment is about 75% motorized. It is hoped that within a short time motorization may be completed with marked increase both in efficiency and economy of maintenance.

Central Library Needed.

Elsewhere in this message I call your attention to the great increase in the demands made upon the branch libraries, and it is pertinent at this time to stress the growing need for a real central library and an extension of the branch system. It is unfortunate that the present condition of the city's finances precludes immediate building of a proper central library, but it is possible at this time to begin to plan toward that end and as preliminary these suggestions are made:

That the city provide a site for a central library.

That a building fund be provided by combining the Rundel fund and the Reynolds library fund, if such a plan be feasible.

That a definite proposal be made to the Reynolds Library to co-operate with the city in the establishment and maintenance of a central library, co-operation along similar lines having worked out satisfactorily in various other cities.

More Economy Urged.

In my first message to your honorable body I called attention to my pledges of economy in the administration of the city's affairs made by me when I was elected to date for mayor, and stressed the need for the fulfillment of these pledges to the greatest limit consistent with efficient functioning of the various departments and bureaus. At the same time attention was called to the fact that constitutional provisions had made impossible the raising by taxation of all the moneys required for the proper administration of all city departments. That condition made necessary the borrowing of money upon short-term notes, and I would call your attention to the fact that during the year just ended the amount that had to be raised by that means was some \$400,000 less than required the preceding year.

This indicates a real start toward reduction of administrative costs, but I am again directing the attention of your honorable body to the need for the exercise of further economies, an injunction in which I appeal for your support.

Nearing Debt Limit.

The financial statement attached to the message shows that the city lacks \$3,838,547.58 of the debt limit which is 10 per cent. of the assessed valuation of the city for taxes of 1922. The valuation was \$35,975,168, 10 per cent. of which is \$3,597,516.80. The city's debt at present amounts to \$32,008,993.22.

The message then sums up the work of municipal departments, detailing the work accomplished. The public market is shown to have received total revenues of \$32,215.30, while expenses were but \$9,974.53, and the Mayor remarks that the market continues to be "a lucrative, as well as popular, adjunct of the Public Works Department." The income from the market he states, has paid in full the bonds issued for its construction, and future incomes will be applied to the reduction of the tax levy.

Water Revenues Large.

Water revenues for the past year approximated one million dollars, the Mayor says, a larger amount than turned in any previous year. This amount was for the water actually sold, through meters, and not revenue from any other sources.

During the year claims filed against the city amounted to \$120,627.66. Settlements made required a total payment of \$30,795.14.

One hundred and thirty compensation cases came up during the year. Eighty-three claimants in these cases were continued on the payroll and forty-seven given awards. The city is a self-insurer and paid during the fiscal year \$11,772.64.

Lions' Club Endorses Site For Central Library After Suggestion Of Assemblyman

Following a talk on the Rochester Central Library project, given by Assemblyman Simon L. Adler before the Lions' Club at the Hotel Rochester yesterday noon, that organization heartily endorsed the site suggested by Mr. Adler, and adopted the slogan "A Central Library in 1925." Mr. Adler, who had been the first to suggest the river site for the proposed structure, explained the history of the project, and pointed out the advantages of the suggested location for Rochester's central library.

After the address, the members of the Lions' Club unanimously passed the following resolution:

"Resolved: That the Lions' Club give cordial approval to the site suggested by the Board of Trustees of the Rochester Public Library for a central library building at the corner of Court street and South avenue and expresses confident opinion to the mayor of the city and to the board of trustees that such site will fully

meet the highest and best requirements for the location of a central and reference library so greatly needed by our city of quality and that we endorse for co-operation in every proper manner the slogan, "A Central

Library in 1925."

This resolution was amplified by an explanatory statement advancing four principal reasons for favoring the proposed site, between South avenue, Court street the "new" street, and the east bank of the river:

1-It obviates the investment of from \$500,000 to \$750,000 for a site.

2-It is as centrally located as could be for all interests; the east side, the west side, the business center, the retail district; it is near the center of population; it is situated upon what will be Rochester's main artery of traffic, namely the subway and the new boulevard.

3-In addition to the now existing arteries of traffic approaching this site and those under construction, another wonderful development is bound to come. With the city purchasing the land between the subway and South avenue and the already existing barge canal harbor approaches between Court and Clarissa street, there only remains the construction of the proposed boulevard approach to the new University site along the river from Clarissa street to Elmwood avenue.

4-A central library on the river site could naturally develop into a civic center because of the natural river surroundings. What wonderful possibilities this opens for the future civic development of our city.

CITY-OWNED PROPERTY EAST OF RIVER URGED AS WISEST CHOICE FOR GREAT BUILDING

CONTINUED FROM PAGE ONE.

so far agree that it outclasses all previously suggested sites. It entirely obviates any controversy between the east and west sides of the city because it unifies the city from the library point of view. It is pointed out that the site is at the very center of what will always be the great traffic transfer points, regardless of the direction of growth of population. According to the plan suggested, this point will be the Library station on the subway and a wing of the library structure will be a station waiting room with stairs leading to the subway.

It is proposed that the Central Library building shall be a beautiful scholastic Gothic structure of blue stone rising directly from the bed of the river, trimmed with Norristone, its vertical lines and rising tower of such dramatic quality as to seem to have risen by magic from the river itself. Given a platform over an enlarged spillway on buttresses built in the river, it is proposed that the best architects in the country be given opportunity to create the most picturesque and suitable building for this particular site. An arcade through the structure from the Aqueduct boulevard to Court street would look out upon the river and afford an added point of beauty and delight.

In the changes in this part of the city now under way, it is declared that the Central Library would have unsurpassed approaches and surroundings. The grounds would be large enough to allow for flower beds and grassy plots. On one side would be the beautiful Genesee, on others the new Boulevard, Court street bridge, the New Harbor Boulevard to the University, and a fine large parking space for automobiles at the north side of the structure skirting the Aqueduct boulevard. In time, too, the Aqueduct boulevard will cut through some of the buildings on the opposite side of South avenue to Chestnut street, affording an added approach to the Central Library.

Build It All at Once.

It is proposed that the entire Central Library structure should be erected at once, although all the room providing for the future growth of the library would not be needed for some years. In the meantime, the part of the building not in use for the Department of Education, affording facilities in keeping with the high place that Rochester's educational system holds in the country. By the time that the library needed all the room, other suitable quarters doubtless will have been provided for the Department of Education. These suggestions are typical of the sensible and business-like ideas which the library officials have sought to plan the proposed building as well as making it an ornament to the city.

The resolutions adopted by the Library Board at its meeting yesterday were as follows:

WHEREAS: The City of Rochester owns the property bounded by South Avenue, Court Street, the new Aqueduct boulevard and the Genesee River; and Whereas extensive improvements are being planned or made upon such property in the construction of the new subway, with a station platform, stairways and waiting room; and Whereas, the Rochester Public Library will, in the near future, require a suitable site for a central library building.

RESOLVED, That the Common Council of the City of Rochester be requested tentatively to reserve said property, as above described, for a central library site, and that the city engineer be requested in all plans and arrangements for subway construction, as far as practicable, to make the same with view to possible ultimate central library use of the property as above described.

Mr. Yust Points Advantages.

City Librarian William F. Yust describes the river site for the Rochester Public Library in this manner.

It is on South avenue between Court street and the new boulevard which is being built over the old Erie canal aqueduct. It is opposite the Osburn House between South avenue and the river. It is only two minutes' walk from Main street, the present greatest thoroughfare of the city. It is right on the new sub-urban boulevard, the future great thoroughfare of the city. It is on South avenue, the leading north and south street east of the river. It is only four minutes' walk from State and Exchange, the leading north and south streets west of the river. Where the above mentioned streets intersect will be the great transfer points of transportation. This will remain true, no matter where the center of population may go. The proposed site adjoins this transfer area. Therefore it could hardly be better located with reference to accessibility.

Meets Sectional Arguments.

Rochester has an east side and a west side and will always have them as long as the Genesee river flows through the city. In years past scores of people have asked me where, in my judgment, the Central Library should be located. My answer has been that it should be either on the east side or on the west side of the river. That answer was always accepted with a laugh except once, when someone said, "Why not put it on top of the river. It is a perfect solution of the problem of east and west side so far as it applies to the Central Library."

There is no place anywhere near the center of the city which offers such splendid possibilities for a beautiful, stately building, the finest and most impressive specimen of architecture in the city. There is a space about 120 feet long and 200 feet wide with streets on three sides and the river on the fourth side. This gives sufficient space on all sides for a dignified setting and approach. In order to appreciate the full sweep of the approach from the south, for example, it is necessary to imagine that all existing buildings have been removed between South avenue and the river south of Court street. These buildings are all owned by the city and will shortly be removed. This will further increase the appropriateness of this river site for a monumental building.

Plenty of Light and Air.

Light and air are of fundamental importance. The open space around the building will be ample to admit an abundance of natural light and fresh air. There will even be room for some lawn and shrubbery and at least from one side there will be no dust unless the river runs dry.

Growth. Another established principle is that there should be room for addition to the building without marring its architectural appearance or impairing its administration. There is sufficient area here for several buildings which would be large enough for a hundred years. A type of building could be adopted consisting of a number of units. These units could be erected one at a time as they are needed. This method, however, would be less likely to produce the best results for the time being and ultimately than to erect a finished structure at once, complete and final. The second alternative would yield more room than is at once needed for library purposes. It has been suggested therefore that any surplus room could be temporarily utilized for other city departments with the understanding that the space so occupied is to be vacated as the library grows and has need for additional room.

Land Cost Small.

Cost of land. The high cost of land is generally the chief obstacle in securing an ideal site for a central library. The larger the city, the more difficult this problem becomes. To buy a site on Main street similar in size and location to the proposed river site would cost three million dollars. The City of Rochester is not in position at present to pay such a sum for this purpose, at least that is the opinion of those who are in charge of its financial affairs. The river site has an estimated real estate value of a half million dollars, and it will not cost a cent, because the city already owns it. The cost of constructing piers, walls, arches, etc., over the subway and the edge of the river will not be greater than the cost of excavating would be on another site. The City Engineer has made a study of the various construction problems involved, and he states that there are no engineering difficulties in the way.

Business Site Preferable.

Residence or business section. Two distinct and opposing ideas exist with regard to the proper location of a library. The one selects a retired, secluded spot, preferably in a grove which the Goddess of Wisdom is supposed to favor for her habitation. Such spots naturally are to be found only in the residential districts. Some of the large public libraries of the country have been located with a tendency in this direction. The most recent and notable example of this kind is the Detroit Public Library opened last year.

The other idea, and this is gaining ground, is that the library is most useful close to the street in the very heart of the business section, because there it makes a stronger appeal to all the people than it does in a residence section apart from the passing throng. A great, impressive building on this river site will be a powerful means of bringing the library to the attention of the people and projecting it into their daily thought.

Rochester Public Library

The Mayor's Message.

D.C. March 1923

The sound judgment of the principal suggestions which Mayor Van Zandt made in his annual message to the Common Council should be evident to all. In his principal suggestions he advocated two projects of major importance and urged the Common Council, and through the aldermen the taxpayers of the city generally, to indorse a policy of sacrificing all but imperative local improvements to the completion of the one major project that already is well under way.

As a permanent policy, of course, such a method of conducting a city's financial affairs would be unwise; but the Mayor has no thought of urging it as a permanent policy. He believes that the rapid-transit subway should be completed as soon as possible, and he is right, for the sooner the subway is completed the sooner will the city enjoy its advantages and the money return that will accrue from its operation.

Of greater importance, because it touches the educational and spiritual life of the city, is the central library project. Rochester long has had the unenviable distinction of being the only city of its class in the whole country without an adequate central library. Its branch library system has been admirably conducted and has developed moderately in keeping with the local needs that it serves. The needs which a central library will serve, however, have been growing more acute as the city has increased in population and in the range of its activities until they have gone far beyond the capacity of the libraries of the University and two seminaries, and the Reynolds Library, to meet them.

The Mayor, though recognizing the importance of this need, also recognizes that city funds for the erection of an adequate central library building will not be available at least until the canal-bed railway is completed. What he proposes, therefore, is that the city at once shall get a site, which is wise because the longer the matter is delayed the less available will the few desirable sites for such an institution become, and then make a definite, responsible proposal to the Reynolds Library trustees for a plan of co-operation with the city in using its resources, together with the funds in the Rundel bequest, in establishing the library on that site. With the Reynolds and Rundel aid the city surely can provide sufficient funds to complete the project.

It may be difficult for some taxpayers to reconcile the Mayor's advocacy of the completion of one expensive major improvement and the inauguration of another, with the admonitions to economy of expenditure which are contained in other parts of his message. The message is consistent in both, however, for real economy consists not alone in avoiding unnecessary expenditure but involves adequate expenditure for major necessities as well.

And the canal-bed subways and a central library are major necessities of great importance to the welfare of Rochester.

WANTS TO COME DOWN.



POSTERS URGING CENTRAL LIBRARY AROUSE INTEREST



Much interest has been displayed by passers-by in the Central Library posters which have been on display during the past week in the windows of the Monroe Branch Library, in Monroe avenue. The Women's City Club is displaying these posters in various windows throughout the city in an effort to arouse public interest in Rochester's need for a central library. Some time in the spring one of the posters will be chosen as the official poster for Central Library publicity.

The Central Library Location

The attention which the Central library is at present receiving prompts me to state a few principles which should guide in the selection of a site. In the first place due consideration should be given to the strong influence which the architecture of public buildings has on the ideas and ideals of the people. This applies especially to a library on account of the nature of its contents. We call it the dwelling place of books, the products of the master minds of the ages, and we refer to the public library as the people's university.

The library building therefore should be an object lesson in architecture, beautiful, dignified, impressive, permanent. It should give the impression that it is an educational institution, not only identified with the instruction and development of the people and giving daily assistance to those who use it, but also standing for all that is noblest and best in the life of the community.

It should be located where it will best fulfill its purposes. In locating it the following points should be considered:

1. Accessibility. It should be near the center of the population to be served. It should be remembered also that this center of population may shift in the course of time. It should be on or near the great thoroughfare or thoroughfares of the city. Nearness to intersecting street car lines is desirable, though if they are too near, the noise will interfere.

2. Approach. Sufficient ground on all sides is desirable but especially in front to provide a dignified setting and approach. There are library buildings, however, which adjoin the sidewalk. This has the advantage of greater convenience to passers-by and affords better advertising possibilities, but it detracts from the architectural effect. Distance is necessary to the appreciation of a monumental building such as the library should be.

3. Light and air. The location should be high and dry with ample space around it to admit an abundance of natural light and fresh air. This forbids the nearness of high buildings or large chimneys emitting heavy smoke or gasses.

4. Growth. There should be room for addition to the building without marring its architectural appearance or impairing its administration.

5. Residence section or business. It may be either section or on the boundary line between the two. Most of the large cities of the country have chosen the residence portion probably because there a suitable site was more easily available or they have compromised on an intermediate location. But the idea is gaining ground that the library is most useful close to the street in the very heart of the retail business section, because there it makes a stronger appeal to the man in the street than it does in a residence section at a secluded distance from the passing throng. This is one way of bringing the library to the attention of the people and projecting it into their daily thought. This principle has had much weight in locating some of our present branch library quarters.

**SITE
AL USE
DINANCE**

**Tax Rolls
Repair
oved.**

et, South avenue
ation of the Cen-
mon Council for
ite for municipal
inance was intro-

POSTERS URGING CENTRAL LIBRARY AROUSE INTEREST



Much interest has been displayed by passers-by in the Central Library posters which have been on display during the past week in the windows of the Monroe Branch Library, in Monroe avenue. The Women's City Club is displaying these posters in various windows throughout the city in an effort to arouse public interest in Rochester's need for a central library. Some time in the spring one of the posters will be chosen as the official poster for Central Library publicity.

6. Relation to other buildings. It is desirable for it to stand on its own ground, to be independent of other buildings and institutions, such as the city hall, a school, a business house, etc. This adds to its appearance, ease of administration and safety from fire. It may well be one of a group of public buildings, such as a school, a church, an art gallery, as in the modern civic center. The position it occupies among such buildings has an important effect on the position it occupies in the minds of the people.

7. Cost of land. In securing a library site the cost of land is an important factor, which may have a modifying influence on any of these points. The opportunity for Rochester to obtain a suitable library site cheap is gone forever. It is still possible to obtain a good site, but it will cost money and a good round sum. It should be the best the city can afford. On the other hand the city can afford the best. It should not be content with anything else.

The city of Rochester does not possess a single building erected for library purposes. In this respect it is behind every other large city in the country and behind many of the small villages in this state. Having waited so long for this important public improvement, it should insist on a building that will be a model from the standpoint of architecture and administration and usefulness. Such a building will be possible only on a site especially selected for that purpose.

PROPOSED RIVER LIBRARY SITE SET ASIDE FOR MUNICIPAL USE BY COMMON COUNCIL ORDINANCE

**Receives Unanimous Vote; Tax Rolls
Confirmed; Police Patrol Repair
and Improvements Approved.**

The site formed by the junction of Court street, South avenue and the subway thoroughfare, suggested as the location of the Central Library, was set aside last evening by the Common Council for municipal purposes. An ordinance preserving the site for municipal purposes was passed by unanimous vote. The ordinance was introduced by Alderman Martin B. O'Neil, floor leader.

Mayor Van Zandt has declared that the city will not consent to locating the Central Library on any site until it is shown conclusively that the site proposed is more advantageous than the one at Court street and South avenue. Many sites have been suggested, including one on the extension of University avenue at Franklin Square. No definite plan for the construction of the Central Library is under consideration because of the condition of municipal finances.



